IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA WESTERN DIVISION No. 5:19-cv-249-FL

)	
MATTHEW BRADLEY,	.)	DEFENDANT ANALYTICAL
)	GRAMMAR, INC.'S APPENDIX
Plaintiff,)	TO LOCAL CIVIL RULE 56.1
v.)	STATEMENT OF
)	UNDISPUTED MATERIAL FACTS IN
ANALYTICAL GRAMMAR, INC.,)	SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION FOR
)	SUMMARY JUDGMENT
Defendant.)	
)	

Exhibit 2: Deposition Transcript of Matthew Bradley taken December 12, 2019 (Ex. 1 to Declaration of D. Booth)

UNITE	ED	STATES	DIS	STRICT	COURT
EASTERN	D	ISTRICT	OF	NORTH	CAROLINA
	V	VESTERN	DI	JISION	

MATTHEW BRADLEY,)
Plaintiff,)
V.	١) Case No. 19-cv-249(FL)
ANALYTICAL GRAMMAR, INC.,	,)
Defendant.)
)

DEPOSITION
OF
MATTHEW BRADLEY

This is the deposition of MATTHEW BRADLEY, taken pursuant to Notice of the parties and in accordance with the North Carolina Rules of Civil Procedure before Kathleen M. Van Voorhis, RPR, at 301 Fayetteville Street, Suite 1400, Raleigh, North Carolina, on the 12th day of December, 2019, beginning at 10:00 a.m.

The reading and signing of this transcript is reserved.

1		APPEARANCES
2		,
3		
4	Plaintiff:	Allan IP Litigation 409 East Boulevard
5		Charlotte, North Carolina 28203 Albert Allan, Esq., appearing
6		Albeit Allan, Esq., appearing
7		
8	Defendant:	Parker Poe Adams & Bernstein, LLP
9		301 Fayetteville Street Suite 1400
10		Raleigh, North Carolina 27602 Catherine Lawson, Esq., appearing
11		and Sloan Carpenter, Esq., appearing
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
25		
د ک		

1	INDEX
2	
3	
4	EXAMINATIONS
5	EXAMINATION PAGE
6	
7	Examination by Ms. Lawson 5
8	
9	
10	
11	EXHIBITS
12	MARKED
13	
14	Defendant's Exhibit 1
	Defendant's Exhibit 2
15	(Superseding Answers and Objections) Defendant's Exhibit 3
16	(Superceding Objections and Responses)
17	Defendant's Exhibit 4
	Defendant's Exhibit 5
18	(The Poke Document) Defendant's Exhibit 6
19	(Twitter Post)
20	Defendant's Exhibit 7
	Defendant's Exhibit 8
21	(Twitter Post) Defendant's Exhibit 9
22	(Complaint)
	Defendant's Exhibit 10
23	(Facebook Terms and Services), Defendant's Exhibit 11
24	(Dec.17Post.PDF)
25	Defendant's Exhibit 12
ب ت	(1000)

1.	EXHIBITS (Continued)	
2	· ·	MARKED
3	Defendant's Exhibit 13	35
4	Defendant's Exhibit 14	36
5	Defendant's Exhibit 15	36
6	Defendant's Exhibit 16	37
7	Defendant's Exhibit 17	37
8	Defendant's Exhibit 18	39
9	Defendant's Exhibit 19	41
LO	Defendant's Exhibit 20	43
11	Defendant's Exhibit 21	48
12	Defendant's Exhibit 22	49
1.3	Defendant's Exhibit 23	49
1.4	Defendant's Exhibit 24	55
15	Defendant's Exhibit 25	57
16	Defendant's Exhibit 26	57
17	Defendant's Exhibit 27	58
18	Defendant's Exhibit 28	58
19	Defendant's Exhibit 29	64
20	Defendant's Exhibit 30	74
21	Defendant's Exhibit 31	67
22	Defendant's Exhibit 32	69
23	Defendant's Exhibit 33	71
24	Defendant's Exhibit 34	75
25		

1 Whereupon, at 10:00 A.M.: 2 MATTHEW BRADLEY, having been duly sworn, 3 4 was examined and testifies as follows: DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MS. LAWSON: 5 All right. Welcome, Mr. Bradley. I hope that your 6 0. 7 travel went smoothly. It's all right. 8 Α. All right. First thing we're going to look over is 9 0. 10 just to confirm your notice of deposition. (Whereupon, Defendant's 1 is 11 marked for identification.) 12 13 This is the Notice of Deposition that told you you were going to be here today. I assume that you have seen 14 this? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And that you're here pursuant to it. Great. 17 Q. 18 MR. ALLAN: There was a supplemental that changed it to 10:00 per my request and I do appreciate that 19 20 consideration, so the record is clear. 21 Ο. Thank you. All right. The first thing we're going to do is just go through a couple of background facts and 2.2 instructions. Will you first please state your full name for 23 24 the record? Matthew Joseph Bradley. 25

- 1 Have you ever been deposed before? 2 Α. No. So, in this deposition as you see our court 3 0. Okay. 4 reporter is going to be recording all of our back and forth 5 questions and answers so it's important that you give a verbal response to any questions that I ask, that is a yes or no 6 7 instead of a nod or un-huh. It makes for a cleaner record. Does that make sense? 8 9 Α. Yes. 1.0 You understand you're under oath this morning? 11 Α. Yes. 12 You understand that means you're obligated to give 13 complete and truthful answers to my questions? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Are you aware of anything that might affect your 16 ability to truthfully answer my questions today? 17 Α. No. 18 All right. As we go back and forth and get into kind 19 of all of these documents and questions, it's also important 20 that we try not to interrupt each other, again, for the
 - Α. Yes.

22

23

24

25

Great. If you need to take a break at any Okav. point, just go ahead and ask me. The only restriction on that that I will request that if I have asked a question you have

clarity of the record. Does that make sense?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

20

to answer that question before we take a break.

- A. I understand.
- Q. Okay. All right. Mr. Bradley, could you please describe your educational background for me?
- A. I have an undergraduate degree from Cornell majoring in physics, then a master's degree in mechanical engineering from Penn State University and I was working on a PhD in electrical engineering until I got too busy with work.
- 10 Q. When was that?
- 11 A. Which?
- 12 | O. The PhD.
- A. That was after the master's so the master's was in 14 '93, so after that through about '96.
- 15 Q. Okay. So you stopped working on --
- A. Pretty much. I think that was the dates but it has been twenty something years so I might be off by a year or two.
- 19 Q. Okay. Are you currently employed?
 - A. Yes.
- 21 0. Where?
- 22 A. I am a high tech consultant.
- Q. Can you describe for me what that means?
- A. The easiest way to describe it is to use an example.
- 25 Do you remember the Motorola StarTac phone?

1 0. Uh-huh.

2

3

4

5

8

. 9

- A. I built the production line for Motorola for that phone, things like that. That's probably the easiest way to explain it. If I get into more details it's not very informative and tends to be boring.
- Q. Fair. Do you do that as a freelancer, contract worker?
 - A. Contract.
 - Q. Contract. Okay. And how long have you been doing that?
- 11 A. Since 1994, full-time since 1998.
- 12 Q. And what did you do before that?
- 13 A. I was on the faculty at Penn State University.
- 14 | 0. And before that?
- 15 A. I was in school.
- Q. Okay. In any of these prior work experiences or your current work experiences, do you have experience with copyrights?
- 19 A. No.
- Q. Before the subject matter of this lawsuit, had you ever filed for a copyright?
- 22 | A. No.
- Q. Okay. All right. I'm going to hand you your

 Superseding Answers and Objections to Defendant's First Set of

 Interrogatories.

1		(Whereupon, Defendant's 2 is
2		marked for identification.)
3	Q.	And then with that also the Objections and Responses
4	to the F	rirst Set of Request for Production of Documents.
5		(Whereupon, Defendant's 3 is
6		marked for identification.)
7	Q.	Feel free to take a minute to familiarize yourself
8	with the	ese. Have you seen these before?
.9	А.	Yeah. This one I haven't but this one I'll take a
LO	look at	to see if I have seen this one. Okay. Yeah. I'm
11	just try	ring to figure out how these are different.
12	Q.	So, Exhibit 2 is your responses to the
13	interrog	gatories.
14	A.	Yes.
15	Q.	Exhibit 3 is the responses to the request for document
16	producti	lon.
17	A.	Oh, I see. Yes. Okay. I understand now. Yes, I
18	have see	en both of them.
19	Q.	You have seen both of them?
20	A.	Yeah.
21	Q.	Do you remember when you first saw these?
22	A.	It would have been about October 30th or so.
23	Q.	Okay. How did you go about answering the
24	interrog	gatories in Exhibit 2?
25	A.	Sat down in front of my computer and typed out answers
	1	

- For Exhibit 2 I'm trying to think if there 1 to all of them. was anything else. I had to look up a couple things on my 2 computer where I had all of the information. It was all done 3 within an hour. 4
 - Q. Okay.

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Α. Maybe two.
- If you'll turn to page three of the responses to the interrogatories you see the large hyperlink in the answer to interrogatory number two?
 - Yes, uh-huh. Α.
- That hyperlink is broken when you put it into a web browser. Do you know if the post for your Facebook post that's the subject matter of the complaint is still live?
- 14 Α. Yes, it is.
 - Okay. Is it still public?
 - I don't know for certain. I believe it is. Α.
 - I represent to you that we looked, went to look Okay. Q. for it on your public Facebook page and it was not there. So, if that is something that can be confirmed and a fresh link sent as a supplement to the interrogatory responses, that would be helpful.
 - Α. Okay.
 - However, as you said in your answer to interrogatory number two, when the post was first made, it was public?
 - That's correct. Α.

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. Okay. Considering the request for production of documents, how did you go about identifying documents that were responsive to those requests?
- A. Well, all of the documents, almost all of them at least I can think of right now, were emails so I have them all in a folder that I, because I organized everything that way, and I just grabbed all of those emails, exported them and that was it.
 - Q. Okay.
- A. The couple other ones, I think there were some PDFs that were from different Facebook posts and I just used Facebook to export them to PDFs. I'm not sure if I remember exactly how I did that, whether I went through Word or not but I didn't do anything very complicated, not very remarkable.
- Q. Okay. So, other than Facebook posts and email files, did you do any other searching for responsive documents?
- A. I didn't have any other responsive documents. All that was in either Facebook or in emails.
- Q. All right. How did you go about searching your Facebook posts for responsive posts or messages or other materials?
- A. Basically based on my memory of, first of all, there was the one on the Facebook post itself and then my memory of when I first -- the only other Facebook posts that were involved were around September 15th where I started receiving

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- 1 rather strange and insulting posts on my Facebook page for 2 other posts and that was easy to find because I remember the date and I just went through and grabbed those as well. 3 4 That's all there is to it.
 - 0. Okay. So, you were primarily quided by memory?
 - There wasn't much to remember even. Α.
 - Okay. How many email accounts do you have? 0.
 - Two primary ones. One, I probably have some throw Α. away ones like qmail ones I never use.
 - Ο. Which email account did you use to communicate about the subject matter of your complaint?
 - mbradley@bradtech.com.
- 13 0. Did you ever use another or a different email 14 account?
 - Not to the best of my knowledge, no.
 - Okay. Did you search that other email account for any Ο. potentially responsive emails?
 - Α. No.
 - What is that other email account primarily used for? Q.
 - At times I have been a part-time adjunct faculty Α. member of Santa Rosa Junior College and it's used for communications about for my department and class work and stuff like that.
 - Q. Do you use social media apps, messaging apps of any kind to communication?

- 1 Α. Facebook Messenger is the only one I can think of. Okay. Did you search Facebook Messenger for any 2 0. potentially responsive communications? 3 I know there is nothing in there that is 4 5 responsive. 6 And is that knowledge based on your memory? Α. 7 Yes. Do you use any other social media accounts other than 8 0. Facebook? 9 10 Α. Can you give me some examples? Twitter? 11 Q. 12 Α. No. 13 Instagram? Q. 14 Α. No. 15 What's App, Tik Tok? Q. 16 Α. I had an account on What's App that I used for talking 17 to some of my clients and I haven't even used it in years. Snapchat? 18 Q. Okay.
- Α. 19 No.
- Tumbler? 20 Ο.
- 21 Α. No.
- Okay. Let's talk about the post. Mr. Bradley, are 22 23 you familiar with the concept of a meme?
- 24 A. Yes.

How would you define a meme?

1 Well, I guess I would say it's a picture with some 2 words on it. Okay. Do you know what it means when something goes 3 4 viral? 5 Α. Yes. How would you define that? 6 0. 7 Where all of a sudden it's all over the internet and 8 for usually for no explained reason. What's the point of a meme? 9 0. 10 I suppose that would depend on the person, the author 11 of the meme. 12 0. Okav. 13 So, that's kind of a very open-ended question. Ιt 14 depends on the meme and it depends on the author. 15 Ο. Can you elaborate? 16 Well, I might make ten memes and have ten different 17 points for them. Somebody else might make ten different memes 18 and have ten different points for them. So, that's a very open-ended question and quite frankly it's almost impossible 19 20 to answer. 21 (Whereupon, Defendant's 4 is marked for identification.) 22 I give you Exhibit 4. It is a Merriam-Webster print 23 24 out definition. You can look on page two at the definition of

a meme.

A. Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. So, you see here that it defines a meme as an idea, behavior, style, or usage that spreads from person to person within a culture. Memes, discrete units of knowledge, gossip, jokes and so on, are to culture what genes are to life. Just as biological evolution is driven by the survival of the fittest genes in the gene pool, cultural evolution may be driven by the most successful memes. Mr. Bradley, have you ever shared a meme through social media, primarily Facebook as
- 11 A. Yes.

you said?

- Q. Okay. Are you generally aware that when people share memes through social media they do it without attribution?
- 14 A. I am not aware of that.
 - Q. Okay. When you shared memes on your social media, did you know who the original author of the meme was?
 - A. I assumed that it was whoever was posting it in the first place. So, I do not, if I am going to share something, I share it with the attribution of the person who I saw it from posted from.
 - Q. Who you most recently saw it from or from the very first person who posted it?
 - A. The very first person.
 - Q. So, when you see a meme you track the entire history of its life on the internet to find the very first instance of

its appearance? 1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

24

- I have never seen it more than once, so.
- Okay. 0.
 - I have never had to do that. Α.
- 0. Okay. So, when you see a meme, you assume that the person posting that meme is the author and you reposted it?
 - Α. That's correct.
- 0. Okay. Did you ask that person's permission before you posted it?
- No because every time that I have shared a meme it has been public, so that is not required.
- So, you find it significant that a public meme does not require permission for reposting?
- As long as I am continuing, what's the word I'm Α. looking for, as long as I still retain the information of who it's from.
 - Can you describe for me what you mean by that? 0.
- I would take someone else's picture and then remove the information as to who it is from and then share that.
- 20 Remove the information from the picture? Ο.
- 21 From the post. Α.
- 22 So, you are talking about resharing a post, not a Q. picture? 23
 - Α. That's correct. I don't reshare pictures. reshare the post because that has the information on it as to

who it came from.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

24

25

- Thank you. All right. What prompted you to Okav. make the wrong on many levels meme?
- I frequently take pictures of things I think are amusing and share them on Facebook. That's all.
- Were you aware of prior memes that had a similar play on imagery and words as the one you ended up creating?
- I don't know. I have since seen similar memes when I searched on my own and I don't know if I had seen them before I had done my own or not.
- Okay. We'll just walk through a couple of examples of those pre-existing.

(Whereupon, Defendant's 5 is marked for identification.)

- Q. Here you can see down at the bottom where the full URL is that it shows that this was created on 2012/3/9, that's either going to be probably March 9th and here you can see on that first page it has a image with two plus two equals five on top of a level with the joke this is wrong on so many levels?
 - Uh-huh. Α.
- 22 Do you remember if you had ever seen this before 23 December 2017?
 - I have never seen it before today. Α.
 - Q. Okay.

1	(Whereupon, Defendant's 6 is
2	marked for identification.)
3	Q. This is Exhibit 6. Here you see this is a post on
4	Twitter dated August 1st, 2016. It has several levels with
5	the word wrong written on them. The caption, rather the post
6	says well this is wrong on so many levels. Do you remember
7	having seen this prior to December 2017?
8	A. No, I don't.
9	Q. Okay.
10	(Whereupon, Defendant's 7 is
11	marked for identification.)
12	Q. This is Exhibit 7. This appears to be the same
13	picture as the one in Exhibit 6, but different post. This
14	this one is to Facebook. Do you remember seeing this prior to
15	your December 2017 post?
16	A. No, I do not.
17	(Whereupon, Defendant's 8 is
18	marked for identification.)
19	Q. Okay. The last one, Exhibit 8, again, same picture as
20	Exhibit 6, again on Twitter with a different person. Do you
21	remember having seen this prior to December 2017?
22	A. No, I do not.
23	Q. If you can try to let me finish the question before
24	answering, just to make it easier on our court reporter.
25	A. Sorry.

So, you were not aware of any of these prior 1 Okay. memes before you created your own image? 2 I have not been aware of them, that's correct. 3 Okay. All right. I'm going to make sure we are all 4 0. on the same page when we refer to the photograph. This is the 5 complaint that was submitted in this case. 6 7 (Whereupon, Defendant's 9 is marked for identification.) 8 9 Mr. Bradley, you are aware that this is the complaint 10 that you filed in this case? Α. 11 Yes. If you flip to the back, couple pages from the back, 1.2 0. Exhibit A. 13 14 Α. There? One more forward. That one is Exhibit B. 15 0. 16 Α. I see. All right. Mr. Bradley, this is your Exhibit A to 17 0. 18 your complaint. Uh-huh. 19 Α. 20 So, this is the photograph that you posted on 21 Facebook, correct? 22 Α. Yes. Okay. Do you still have the original photograph on 23

Α.

your phone or computer?

Yes, I do.

24

1 0. And you took that photograph yourself, correct? 2 Α. Yes, I did. Okay. All right. So, for the rest of this deposition 3 Ο. 4 when I refer to the photograph, Exhibit A to your complaint is what I'm referring to. Is that understood? 5 6 Α. Yes. 7 Did you post this photograph anywhere other Okav. than Facebook? 8 9 Α. No. 10 0. Why did you post it on Facebook? I often post pictures that I think are funny. 11 Α. And I believe you already said earlier that the 12 privacy setting when you posted it was to public? 13 Α. Correct. 14 15 0. Why was it public? Α. If my friends want to share, share one of my posts, 16 17 I'm perfectly fine with that. 18 Okay. Are you aware that your conduct on Facebook is 19 governed by the terms and services of Facebook? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Have you read those terms and services before? 22 Α. I have. 23 (Whereupon, Defendant's 10 is marked for identification.) 24 25 Okay. If you look on that first page at section two,

- 1 Sharing your Content and Information, do you see that? heading two, little subheading one, it says that, "For content 2
- that is governed by intellectual property rights, like photos 3
- and videos, IP content, you specifically give us the following 4
- 5 permission, subject to your privacy and application settings:
- you grant us an non-exclusive, transferable, sub-licensable, 6
- royalty-free, worldwide license to use any IP content that you
- post on or in connection with Facebook. This IP License ends 8
- 9 when you delete your IP content or your account unless your
- 10 content has been shared with others and they have not deleted
- it". Do you agree that that is what that says? 11
- I do. 12 Α.
- 13 0. So, these are the terms and conditions that govern your activity on Facebook, correct? 14
- 15 Α. Correct.
- Okay. So, you understand that based on that language, 16 17 you granted a license to the photograph?
- To Facebook. 18 Α.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 Α. Yes.
- Okay. All right. Looking at the photograph as it is 21 shown in Exhibit A, so you confirm that this is a picture that 22 was first posted to your Facebook account, correct? 23
- 24 Α. Yes.

Okay. Can you describe the copyright management

1 information that identifies you as the photographer of the 2 photograph? Α. There is the -- I'm sorry. Could you please repeat 3 that question, make sure I understand it. 4 5 Q. Can you describe, what on the photograph indicates that you are the photographer? 6 7 There is the metadata on the photograph itself which identifies me as the photographer, my phone more 8 9 specifically. 10 Ο. Okay. Is that metadata included in the Facebook 11 post? 12 As far as I'm aware it is. Α. 13 0. Have you confirmed that? 14 Α. No. Have you produced that metadata? 15 Ο. To my legal counsel. 16 Α. (Whereupon, Defendant's 11 is 17 marked for identification.) 18 19 I'm going to mark this is now the December 17 post. All right. Mr. Bradley, this is what you produced as the 20 21 December 17 Post PDF. 22 Yes. Α. 23 Now, the image that appears in this is not the 24 original image from December 2017, correct? 25 Correct. Α.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

24

- So, this is what you produced to us in response to our request that you show us the Facebook post and the photograph. Did you produce us metadata from this post that connects it to your authorship?
 - The metadata is part of the photograph itself. would have to have the ability to read that metadata to get it off of that. That's not going to be on a document like this.
 - So, did you confirm that if somebody on Facebook right clicked on that photograph, that it would show the metadata that you claim identifies you as the author?
 - Α. I did not.
 - Okay. Looking at the photograph as it is portrayed in Exhibit A of the complaint, so setting aside the metadata that has not been produced, what about that photograph tells us that you were the author?
 - The photograph itself does not. It's the post that does, which has my name on it.
 - Q. Okay. So, the post, the entire post, not the photograph, but the post is what you claim provides the management information for your copyright?
- It provides the proof that I am the author of it, 22 23 yes.
 - But that information is not in the photograph? 0. Okay.
 - Α. No.

1 Q. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

- It is in the metadata of the photograph, but not visible in the photo as it is shown.
- Q. Okay. But today you cannot prove to me that that metadata is either included in the Facebook post or that it has been produced in this case?
- Again, I provided that to my lawyer. I do not know if Facebook, if it, Facebook postings preserve the metadata information. I'm unaware of that.
- 1.0 0. Okay.
 - It may be, it may not, I don't know.
 - So, other than the metadata that you don't know if whether or not it is included with the photograph when it gets posted to Facebook, does the photograph have your copyright management information within the four corners of the photograph?
 - No, not the original.
- 18 Q. Okay. Correct. Which is the December 2017 19 photograph?
- 20 Α. Yes.
- All right. Similarly, that copyright management 21 2.2 information is not a watermark on the photograph?
- 23 Α. No.
- You did not put the copyright management information 24 on a sticker and attach it to the photograph before posting it 25

1 to your Facebook? 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Α. I did not.
- The copyright management information was not affixed 0. to the photograph in some way, correct?
 - Α. It was not.
- So, if somebody copied the photograph itself, the copyright management information that you claim is in the post would not have been copied with it?
 - Δ That's correct.
- So, to your knowledge if somebody copied just the photograph from your Facebook page and posted it somewhere else on Facebook, the copyright management information you're describing would not necessarily be copied with it?
- That's correct. Α.
- So, posting a copy of the photograph without that copyright management information would not require removing the copyright information from the photograph, would it?
- I mean, from a technical perspective it would not require it.
 - MR. ALLAN: Just answer the question.
- I'm just trying to make sure I understood it, that's all.
- All right. Unless you need a break, we're going to start walking through the comments on the post. Is that okay?
 - We're going to go through all of them?

- 1 Q. Not one by one but the sticky tabs for them.
- 2 A. All right.
- Q. Okay. All right. If you look at the first page of Exhibit 11, see Josh Vallee says, "This is good, I just might
- 5 | have to steal this one"?
- 6 A. Right.
- Q. Okay. If you look on the second page you respond to him saying, "Go ahead"?
 - A. Right. An explanation, he is my -MR. ALLAN: There is no question.
- 11 A. Okay.

10

- Q. If you look still at that first page to the lower right hand corner of Vallee's post, do you see that little one?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. Is that an indication of a like of his comment?
- 17 A. I don't know.
- Q. Okay. We weren't able to confirm whether or not it is
- 19 | a like because the post appears to no longer be public. So,
- 20 | that is one of the reasons we need a fresh, live link to the
- 21 | post. Do you remember if you liked his comment?
- 22 A. That I liked it, is that a Facebook like?
- 23 Q. A Facebook like.
- 24 A. I don't remember.
 - Q. Okay. If you look at page two, so MB 014, about two

- thirds of the way down, Tonya Liburd says, "Stealing", do you 1 2 see that?
- Α. Uh-huh. 3

5

6

8

9

15

- Again, it looks like we have an indication that her comment was liked. Do you remember whether you Facebook liked her comment?
- 7 Α. I don't recall.
 - Okay. All right. We're going to turn to page MB 026. 0.
 - Okay. Α.
- 10 All right. Right under the image that's there, Joseph Hennessy also commented, "I had to steal this", and it again 11 appears somebody has Facebook liked his comment. 12 13 remember if you Facebook liked his comment?
- 14 Α. I do not.
 - Okay. Mr. Bradley, did you read all of these comments when they started coming on to your post?
- 17 Probably not all of them. Α.
- Did you notice that this many people were commenting 18 19 on your post?
- 20 Yes. Α.
- 21 Did you notice how many people were sharing your 22 post?
- 23 Α. Yes.
- 24 When you first made this post in December 2017, what did you expect would happen? 25

- 1 As with other posts I have done there, I might get five to ten, maybe fifty at most likes. 2 Typically that's what usually happens with my posts. Josh, for example, always 4 tends to like my posts so I wasn't surprised at all he was the first one to like it. 5
 - Okay. Did you expect to do anything else with the meme that you created?
 - At that time, no. Ά.
 - So, you did not expect it to go viral? Q.
- 10 Α. No.

7

8

9

14

- You did not expect to use it on merchandise of any 11 kind? 12
- At that time, no. 13 Α.
- So that you expected five to ten, maybe fifty people 15 to like it. Did you expect people to share it?
- 16 Maybe a couple. Α.
- 17 But you did expect that at least one person might 0. 18 share it?
 - I didn't expect it. I wouldn't have been surprised. Α.
- 20 Q. When did you first realize that your meme was going viral? 21
- 22 I believe it was not too long later that night after I posted it when there was a couple, maybe a hundred shares all 23 24 of a sudden or something like that, that just seemed to be an enormous number for me. 25

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. Okay. When did you first see it published by someone other than yourself?
 - A. December 2018.
- Q. So, between December 2017 and December 2018 you were unaware that other places were posting your meme?
 - A. That's correct.
- Q. If we can turn to MB 040. All right. You see there is a comment by Angie Fogo Moulton and you responded to it saying, "Sorry, the picture is the joke. I included the link to my blog because I thought people might enjoy it. I really didn't expect 100 shares, so this is kind of surprising to me". Then you have a parenthetical comment. This was it says that it was one year ago, so presumably that's one year ago from --
- A. I believe that is probably not correct because from what I understand Facebook, for example, it would have to be if we looked at it today, December 7th of this year it would still say one year and then if we look at it December 8th then it just goes to two years, but this was shortly after, probably within a week of the original posting.
- Q. All right. Again, if we had the live version of the post we would be able to more easily verify whether that one year mark means December '18 or December '17, so again, if you could figure out where the post still lives that would be helpful in confirming that, but to your memory you believe

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that this was still within a week of the December 2017 post?

- Correct. Almost all of the comments were within a couple of weeks of the original posting.
- Q. Okay. So, within a week of the original posting you were aware that it was being widely shared?
 - Α. Shared, yes.
- Okay. If you turn the page to 41, this is why I question the timeline of Moulton's comment being one week after, you see here Mick Macklemore making a comment about the Did you make an edit to your post prior to December 2018?
 - I put in the link to my blog. Α.
- 13 0. Okay.
 - That's all. At that point there was 12,000 shares. Α.
 - 0. Did you look at the shares as they were happening?
- The first couple of weeks. 16 Α.
 - So, after that you didn't really follow up on the 0. subsequent shares in your Facebook history?
 - I would look perhaps once a month and they hadn't been changing much after that, it was still at 19,000, some odd number of shares.
 - So, by changing much you mean the number of shares? Q.
 - The number of shares, yes. Α.
 - Okay. Did you go through to look at the individual shares that were happening to see what those ultimate reshares

looked like?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

- At first I did but with that many shares I didn't bother.
 - 0. Why?
 - It took too much of my time. Α.
 - Why did you add the link to your blog to the post? 0.
 - Α. Because I wanted people to read my bloq.
- All right. You see here that same thread on page 41 0. between you and Mick Macklemore?
- 10 Α. Yes.
 - It says at the bottom of his response to you, view 29 more replies, and that's an unexpanded list of replies?
 - Yes. He just kept insulting me and saying I was sleazy for including my blog link on there and one of my friends, Verna, defended me and he started saying nasty things to her and I said well, she has every right to be here, she's one of my friends, you're not, and that's it. At which point he blocked me which is why you see the blank. I don't know why it didn't print out all 29 replies.
 - The rest of those replies are about the post? Q. Okay.
 - Yes, about the linking to the blog.
- Okay. Mr. Bradley, what was your response when the meme started going viral? 23
 - From the Facebook perspective I was pleased.
 - What about not the Facebook perspective?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2.1

22

23

24

- A. Then I was concerned because I wasn't aware that it was so widespread other than the shares on Facebook and I was both a little flattered and a little annoyed that people were stealing it, not sharing it, but literally stealing it because when I see somebody say on Facebook that they're stealing something I assume they mean sharing because that's what typically people say, that's what they do and I was concerned that people were actually stealing it and not sharing it.
- Q. Okay. So, when you hear somebody saying that they're going to steal it, to you that means sharing?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. What's the basis of that belief?
- A. Just like my friend Josh, who is my cousin's husband, when he says steal it he means share it. Other people that I have had say steal it, they mean share it because they actually do share it. They don't really steal it.
- Q. Were all of the people circulating the photograph your friends?
- A. No, but I assumed that when since everyone else that I had ever heard say steal it meant share it, I assumed that that was true of all of the rest.
 - Q. But it was just an assumption on your part?
- A. It was.
- Q. Okay. All right. If we turn to MB 43, so here about half way down we see your friend Josh Vallee commenting

	BRADLEY, MATTHEW on 12/12/2019 Page 3
1	again?
2	A. Yes.
3	Q. "OMG, this got some traction Matthew", and you respond
4	to him saying, "I know, still can't believe it, I am stunned,
5	the good news is I thought of something even better, coming
6	soon"?
7	A. Yeah.
8	Q. So, is this an accurate statement that you were
9	stunned in a happy way when it started going viral?
10	A. Yes. Again, this is just after, this is still
11	probably around 13,000 shares.
12	Q. Okay.
13	A. So, it's still within about a week or two of the
14	original posting.
15	Q. And then here you see down at the bottom of that back
16	and forth between you and Josh there is another option to view
17	one more reply?
18	A. Yeah. I don't remember off hand what that is.
19	Q. Okay. So, Mr. Bradley, earlier you said that you
20	believed you first became aware that other mediums were
21	sharing the photograph in December of 2018; is that correct?
22	A. Yes. To the best of my knowledge, that is correct.
23	Q. Okay. This is now Exhibit 12.
24	(Whereupon, Defendant's 12 is

marked for identification.)

- Q. You see that this is a post from you on April 20, 2018?
 - A. Yes, that is true. I had forgotten that one.
 - Q. Okay. Tell me what this post is?
- A. Well, my friend Luke Thompson had let me know that my picture was on The Most Clever Puns the Internet Has to Offer.
 - Q. Why did you share that article?
 - A. Well, I was pleased that it had been shown somewhere else.
 - Q. Somewhere else meaning not Facebook?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. If you look at your first comment under that post you say, "Hey, I'm famous, my picture made the list of the most clever puns on the internet, woo hoo"?
- 16 A. Yes.

4

8

9

10

11

19

20

21

22

23

24

- 17 Q. You were excited by this coverage?
- 18 A. Granted.
 - Q. Okay. If you look at the third comment that you have on that post you say, "About my picture, 'The person who came up with this one definitely leveled up in the pun game'", is that a guote from the article?
 - A. I believe that is.
 - Q. Okay. Since the article said the person who came up with this one, does that mean that the article did not

identify you as the creator of the meme? 1 2 That's correct. 3 And yet you still shared this article and celebrated it? 4 5 Α. Yes. Were you aware of other articles that 6 Okay. Q. 7 celebrated the photograph? To my knowledge, not until about December of 2018. 8 9 Ο. Okay. 10 (Whereupon, Defendant's 13 is marked for identification.) 11 12 All right. Exhibit 13 is a BuzzFeed article, 17 Puns 13 That You'll Need to be a Little Clever to Get, posted on 14 January 27, 2018? 15 Α. Uh-huh. 16 And the puns in the back did not print their images 17 for unknown reasons. Let's see. If you look at AG 0036, you 18 can see number six there, this pun, which is just wrong on so many levels? 19 20 Α. Uh-huh. 21 Q. With what appears to be the photograph, correct? Correct. 22 Α. Okay. And this does not identify you? 23 Q. 24 That is also correct. Α. 25 In any way? Q.

```
1
         Α.
             Correct.
             Do you remember seeing this article?
 2
             No, I do not.
 3
         Α.
 4
         0.
             Okav.
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 14 is
 5
                                  marked for identification.)
 6
 7
             This is an article from August 26, 2019, The Most
     Clever Puns The Internet Has To Offer, on page starting on
 8
     AG 0072 towards the end you can first see at the bottom the
 9
10
     caption, that's so wrong, and on the next page appears to be a
     clipped version of the photograph, correct?
11
12
         Α.
             Yes.
13
         0.
             This does not identify you with the photograph,
14
     correct?
15
             That's correct.
         Α.
             Okay. Have you seen this article before?
16
         0.
17
         Α.
             Not to my knowledge, no.
18
         Ο.
             Okay.
                                   (Whereupon, Defendant's 15 is
19
                                  marked for identification.)
20
21
                    So, you see this is a post on Facebook from
22
     Unilad Tech?
23
         Α.
             Okay.
2.4
             And that is the photograph, correct?
         Q.
25
         Α.
             Yes.
```

1	Q.	With the caption this is wrong on so many levels?
2	А.	Yes.
3	Q.	This does not identify you with the photograph,
4	correct	?
5	А.	That's correct.
6	Q.	Do you remember having seen this before today?
7	А.	No, I do not.
8	Q.	Okay.
9		(Whereupon, Defendant's 16 is
10		marked for identification.)
11	Q.	This is the Twisted Sifter. This is an article that
12	was pub	lished on September 18, 2019, The Shirk Report on
13	page	
14	Α.	51.
15	Q.	Thank you. That is a picture of the photograph?
16	А.	Uh-huh.
17	Q.	With no connection between you and the photograph,
18	correct	?
19	Α.	Correct.
20	Q.	Do you remember having seen this before today?
21	А.	No, I do not.
22		(Whereupon, Defendant's 17 is
23		marked for identification.)
24	Q.	This is from Flip image and you see this is actually
25	other m	emes regarding levels?
	<u></u>	

- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. So, this meme is wrong on so many levels on that first page there?
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Do you recall seeing any of these?
- 6 A. No.

5

9

16

21

22

23

24

- Q. All right. You never saw any of those images prior to December, 2017?
 - A. Not to my knowledge.
- Q. Okay. All right. So looking at the Exhibits 14, 15, 16 and the BuzzFeed article, do any of these articles identify authors of the memes?
- 13 A. You mean are you talking about the other pictures?
- 14 Q. Uh-huh.
- 15 A. I don't know. I haven't looked at the articles.
 - Q. Okay. Do you want to pull out Exhibit 14?
- 17 A. I don't see any.
- 18 | Q. Okay.
- A. And I would have to look at each and every one, but I don't see any.
 - Q. Okay. That's fine. Mr. Bradley, since December 2017 when you made the wrong on so many levels meme, have you since posted other memes and hoped that they would go viral?
 - A. Well, according to the definition you have of memes it almost has to go viral for it to be a meme so by that

1 definition no because nothing else that I posted on my 2 personal Facebook pages had that same reaction. Have you posted other images with words overlaid in 3 them in a funny or cleaver way that you intended for people to 4 5 share? Α. Yes. 6 7 Q. Okay. Go back to the, yeah, full post, MB 058. 8 Α. Okay. About two thirds of the way down you see that you made 9 0. 10 a comment, "If you liked my previous post check out the latest one, dot dot dot"? 11 12 Α. Yes. So, you were encouraging people who had looked at, 13 14 commented, shared and liked the photograph to follow your 15 other materials? 16 Α. Yes. And to share, comment, like? 17 Ο. 18 Α. Yes. You wanted those other images? 19 0. Okav. 20 Α. Yes. 21 Q. To be shared and to go viral? 22 Yes. Α. 23 Q. Okay. (Whereupon, Defendant's 18 is 24 marked for identification.) 25

- Q. I'm handing you a document marked MB 70. So, this is a post of yours, yes?
 - A. Correct.
 - Q. Okay. So, you posted several photos of a hammer followed by drills with commentary on them?
- 6 A. Yes.

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

2.3

24

- Q. Within this image or this series of images that you posted, did your name appear on those images?
 - A. On the images, no.
 - Q. Okay. Your first comment there on MB 071 says, "As always, please feel free to share"?
- 12 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. And then, if you see further down below,

 Jennifer Ippoliti says, "Matt, Matt, Matt, have you learned

 nothing from the so many levels debacle? Watermark those

 photos, man".
- 17 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Well, then there is 17 replies, I'm not sure if that's above or below your comment, but your second comment to her on this page says, well, your first comment says, "Actually, I copyrighted that photo". Your second comment says, "And I'll do the same here if it takes off"?
 - A. Yes. And I meant immediately, not waiting for it.

 MR. ALLAN: Wait until there is a question.
 - A. Sorry. Sorry. Sorry.

Why would you not copyright it immediately? 1 Q. 2 Α. It costs money. Why would you not put your name in a watermark on the 3 4 image immediately? I hadn't thought of it. 5 Α. Why wait until it becomes popular? 6 Ο. 7 Again, because copyrighting it would cost money and I Α. just didn't feel like spending money on anything unless 8 9 somebody liked it, it actually took off. So, until after it went viral? 10 Ο. 11 Α. Correct. 12 Q. Okay. (Whereupon, Defendant's 19 is 13 14 marked for identification.) So, this is another post by you? 15 Q. 16 Α. Yes. Okay. And this is another pun, Buoys will be Buoys 17 but they're buoys? 18 19 Yes. Α. So, this is another meme that you created? 20 Q. Α. 21 Uh-huh. 22 Are those photographs your photographs? No, they're not. 23 Α. In the drills pictures, the previous exhibit, 24 Okav. 0. were those photographs your photographs? 25

1 Α. Yes, they were. Those ones were. Okay. But the photographs on 2 0. Exhibit 19 are not? 3 No, they're not. 4 Α. This also does not have within those images any 5 0. 6 association of your name? 7 Α. That's correct. No watermark claiming them as yours? 8 0. 9 Α. That's correct. Okay. Mr. Bradley, Exhibit 19 was not produced by 10 11 you? 12 Α. No, it wasn't. Okay. Why? 13 Q. I don't understand the question. 14 Α. 15 0. Okay. Why wasn't it produced by me? 16 Α. 17 Q. Uh-huh. I didn't take the pictures. 18 Α. 19 But you made the post? 0. 20 Yes. Α. Okay. Can you explain to me why the fact that you did 21 not take the pictures made you believe that this Facebook post 22 23 of a meme that you shared was not responsive? A. At the time I did not understand what the copyright 24

laws were.

1 Can you explain what you mean by that? I didn't understand what could and could not be 2 copyrighted. 3 What's the impact of that lack of understanding? 4 Well, if anybody had copyrighted these photos, I would 5 Α. 6 be liable for a copyright infringement on those individually, 7 so. What's the basis for your belief in that? 8 9 Α. What I have learned about copyright laws since then. MR. ALLAN: You can answer the question to the extent 10 it doesn't disclose communications you had with counsel. 11 12 No, that's before what I read in December 2018 about copyright law. 13 14 Q. Okay. (Whereupon, Defendant's 20 is 15 marked for identification.) 16 This is not a meme. This is a news article, 17 18 correct? 19 Α. Correct. Okay. You can turn to page two, see that Tyler Potter 20 Q. commented, "No matter which side you take, it's just wrong on 21 so many levels". You responded, "It's everywhere now. 22 23 a guy at work who said that was one of his favorite pictures

24

25

on the internet. He uses it all the time. When he found out

I took it, he acted like he was meeting a celebrity idol"?

1 Α. Yes. 2 Okay. How did you respond to the person at work telling you that it's one of his favorite pictures on the 3 internet and that he uses it all of the time? 4 5 I warned him to be careful of copyright infringement. 6 You warned him to be careful of copyright 7 infringement? 8 Α. 9 Yes. So, you say he acted like he was meeting a celebrity 10 0. 11 idol? 12 Α. Yes. 13 Q. Was that pleasing? 14 Α. Yes. 15 You can pull out the request for production Q. Okay. 16 responses that you gave. That's Exhibit 3. Α. Okay. 17 If you could turn to page nine. 18 All right. 19 top of the page document request number 22 says, asks you to produce documents sufficient to show and identify any 20 21 photograph or other creative work that Plaintiff created or 22 authored and posted online. Where are we? 23 MR. ALLAN:

Q.

MR. ALLAN:

24

25

Page nine at the top, number 22.

Okay.

- Documents sufficient to show and identify any 1 photograph or other creative work that Plaintiff created or 2 3 authored and posted online with the intent, design, aim, hope 4 or purpose that it would become a meme, your response to that RFP was Plaintiff does not have any documents in his 5 6 possession responsive to request number 22, do you see that? 7 Α. Yes. Looking again at Exhibit 19? 8 0. 9 Α. Yes. 10 0. Is this a meme? No, not at this point. 11 Α. 12 What do you think it is? 0. 13 Α. Just a picture that I made.
- 15 Α. Yes.

Q.

Okay.

14

. 20

16 So, it's a creative work that you made? Q. Okay.

Is it a creative work?

- 17 Α. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And you posted it online, yes?
- Α. 19 Yes.
 - And did you believe it might become a meme? Q.
- 21 Maybe, but honestly I have no idea what makes Α. something a meme so I just posted. 22
- Did you hope people would share it? 23 0.
- Not really. I guess I would have been pleased if 24 25 people shared it but I didn't hope that they shared it.

- Q. Okay. If you look at the comment on, the first comment on Exhibit 19, Josh Vallee says, "Another attempt? I don't know if anything will top your first one", and then you respond, "That was lightning in a bottle. I had many before, I will have more in the future. If I get lucky again, well,
- 6 | it happens"?

10

11

12

13

20

21

22

23

24

- A. Yeah.
- Q. That's the hope, that the creative works you make will go viral?
 - A. No. It's a statement that if it ever happens again, because I don't know if it ever will. I'm not trying to necessarily. I'm just posting things that I think are funny.
- Q. You say I will have more in the future?
- A. More pictures like that. I frequently post pictures like that.
- Q. Okay. And that was the basis for why you believe that this post was not responsive to request for production number 22?
 - A. Yeah. I'm not trying to make anything become, go viral. I just posted just as much as I had before, just as much as I have since, maybe a little less actually. I have been busier.
 - Q. Have you created other creative works similar to Exhibit 19 that you did not produce?

1 Α. Yes.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

- 2 Q. How many?
- 3 Same reason, I don't know how many. I have been doing Α. 4 it for years on Facebook.
 - Q. Okay. So, you're not aware of how many other of these types of creative works?
 - Sometimes I do one or two a week. Sometimes it's months between them. So, it's just something I do for fun to share with my friends. I don't think of them as something I'm trying to make go viral because I don't have any idea how to do that.
 - Do you hope any of them will be shared?
- 13 Not hope. Pleased if they are shared but if they 14 aren't it's like I'm doing if for my friends, like I said. Ιf they want to share them, fine, if they don't, fine. 15
- 16 You're posting them for public consumption? Ο.
- 17 A. Yes.
 - Q. Okay.
- 19 As I said, if they want to share them, fine.
- 20 Okay. All right. If you go to page MB 063 of the Ο. 21 December 17 Post document, Exhibit 11.
- I'm sorry. What page? 22 MR. ALLAN:
- 23 MS. LAWSON: 063.
- 24 Down at the very bottom of the page, Ricco Wayne 25 Fleming said, "Matthew Bradley, can you post a non meme

It'd be fun to see who gets it without the actual 1 version? 2 And the next page you say, "No problem", and you provide a link to a post? 3 I believe that is the link to the original post before 4 the edits, but I'm not certain. 5 Okay. So, this is requesting a link back to the 6 0. 7 photograph as it appears in Exhibit 2 of your complaint, not the edited version that you posted after December 2018, 8 9 correct? 10 I believe that's correct, yes. 11 Okay. Q. 12 (Whereupon, Defendant's 21 is 13 marked for identification.) 14 I had forgotten I had even posted this. 15 All right. So, this is, to the best of your 16 recollection is this the post that you were linking to in the unmeme'ed version? 17 18 I believe this is, but the difference is that it does 19 have the copyright information on it. 20 This is dated December 15th, 2018? Ο. 21 Yes. Α. 22 So, this one has the actual a copyright watermark down at the bottom right hand corner, correct? 23 24 I don't call it a watermark. I just call it a

25

copyright. A watermark is a different thing.

1 0. Fair enough. All right. (Whereupon, Defendant's 22 and 23 2 are marked for identification.) 3 All right. We're going to look at 22 and 23 together. 4 5 So, Exhibit 22, MB 066 is what you produced as the edit history for the December 2017 post, and then Exhibit 23, 6 7 AG 0010, is what Analytical Grammar produced as the edit history it found when the post was still public. Can you 8 9 explain why your production shows an incomplete edit 10 history? Objection. You can answer. 11 MR. ALLAN: As far as I know, it would probably be a Facebook --12 better off asking Facebook that question. I have no idea. 13 Q. Okay. All right. So, looking at Exhibit 23, you can 14 15 see that it first shows this is wrong on so many levels December 8th, 2017 at 5:02 P.M. and the image there is 16 17 missing, but the image there was the photograph, correct? 18 Α. That's correct. Then it shows that on December 14th, 2017 at 19 11:31 A.M. you edited it to add wow, I am stunned and then you 20 21 provide a link to your blog, correct? 22 Α. Correct. 23 And then there is another edit on December 0. Okav. 14th, 2017, not too long later, where then you add an 24 25 explanation for why you edited the post's caption, correct?

A. Correct.

1

8

9

- Q. Okay. And then we see down on December 14th, 2018 at
- 3 | 10:48 P.M. you added a notation, "Please note that this
- 4 | picture is copyrighted. I appreciate all of you who shared
- 5 | it, very unexpectedly. Some people, however, are passing it
- 6 off as their own work. I took the picture with my phone.
- 7 | This is the original photo, meme added"?
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. That was when you substituted the picture that now appears on page one of Exhibit 11, correct?
- 11 A. I can verify that. Exhibit 11.
- 12 Q. Yes. It's the large, it's the post one right there.
- 13 A. This one?
- 14 O. Uh-huh.
- 15 A. I believe that's correct.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 | 0. What prompted you to change the picture?
- 18 A. Well, there are two changes to the picture. One is
- 19 adding the words and the other is adding the copyright. The
- 20 | words, I just thought that some people had commented that I
- 21 | should add the words and I figured while I'm doing that I
- 22 | might as well add that as well. The copyright is for my own
- 23 | protection.
- Q. Okay. What prompted the change?
- 25 A. Which change?

- 1 0. The change to the photograph?
 - Which change to the photograph? Α.
 - Let's take them one by one. What prompted the addition of the actual, the pun joke?
 - As I said, you just asked that question and I said people suggested that it would be better to have the words in there as well.
 - Right. But this was a year later?
 - Α. Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

17

- 10 What made you go between December 2017 to December 2018 to decide now is the time that I'm going to change the 11 12 words?
- That week I didn't have anything to do because of my 13 Α. work situation. I was also going to be having surgery shortly 14 15 and I just happened to revisit it that week and took care of it then. 16
 - Then what prompted the addition of the copyright?
- I had copyrighted it. 19
- 20 Okay. So, you had at that point received your Q. 21 registration?
- 2.2 Α. No. I had filed it.
- 23 What prompted you to file that? Q. Okav.
- 24 To answer that question fully I'm going to start with 25 Dick from accounting, and --

MR. ALLAN: Before you give cryptic answers, don't disclose any communications with your attorney.

A. I won't.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

2.3

24

- MR. ALLAN: Okay.
- A. As I said --
- Q. If I may interrupt you very quickly, I'm not asking about the substance of any communications with an attorney but if you did talk to an attorney that fact is something you can share.
- A. No. What happened was, as I said, that week I didn't have anything to do workwise and I just happened to do a Google image search and that's when I found out that it was all over the place and I clicked on the first one and it was a Reddit post and it was my photo and somebody had put their, given themselves credit and the first name was Dick from accounting and that annoyed me and at that point I decided to see -- there were two problems there, one is somebody had taken the picture and used it somewhere else without my knowledge, and second of all they had taken credit for themselves. Both of those annoyed me and so then I started to look into copyrighting it.
- Q. Okay. And then looking again at page MB 13 of that exhibit.
 - A. Uh-huh.
 - Q. Exhibit 11, so you have the text superimposed, this is

wrong on so many levels, and down in the right hand corner you 1 2 have copyright 2018 Matthew J. Bradley? 3 Yes. 4 Q. The copyright application was not an image of the 5 photograph with that text on it, correct? 6 Α. That is not correct. It was both with and 7 without the text. 8 Q. Okay. 9 (Whereupon, a recess was taken.) Welcome back. Mr. Bradley, you understand that you 10 are still under oath, correct? 11 12 Α. Yes. Okay. Let's turn back to Exhibit 2, the superseding 13 14 answers and objections to the first set of interrogatories. 15 Α. Yes. 16 If you can turn to page nine, if can you just 17 confirm for me that that is your signature? 18 Α. Yes. 19 Thank you. And then if you can turn to page eight, please, excuse me, page six. I'm sorry. 20 21 Α. Uh-huh. 22 All right. If you can look at interrogatory number 11 down towards the bottom. In your response to that 23 24 interrogatory you said, "Plaintiff's name was conveyed in

25

connection with the initial publication of the photograph on

- BRADLEY, MATTHEW on 12/12/2019 his Facebook page", do you see that? 1 2 Α. Yes. 3 0. Okay. You are the plaintiff referred to in this response, correct? 4 Α. Correct. 5 Okay. Other than your name, do you claim that there 6 is any copyright management information conveyed in connection 7 with the initial publication of the photograph? 8 Α. No. I agree with you. Okay. So, just to confirm some of what you said 10 0. earlier, there was no copyright tag that appeared in 11 12 connection with the initial publication of the photograph? 13 Α. Correct. Sorry. What? 14 Q. 15 Correct. Α. Was there any author attribution line conveyed 16 Q. in connection with the initial publication of the 17 photograph? 18 The Facebook post itself has my name on it. 19 Α. 20 Okay. But not the photograph itself? Q. 21 That's correct. Α. 22
 - Is there any information that identified you as the photographer conveyed in connection with the initial publication of the photograph?
 - Publication, yes, because it was on my Facebook page

24

```
and it had my name on it.
1
            Was there any information that identified you as the
3
    photographer on the photograph?
        Α.
4
             No.
             Okay. All right.
5
        Q.
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 24 is
6
                                 marked for identification.)
7
8
             This is the December 16, 2017 post by Analytical
    Grammar/Grammar Planet that shows the photograph along with
9
10
    the caption this is wrong on so many levels, correct?
11
         Α.
             Correct.
             That image that appears there, is there anything that
12
         0.
13
    was removed from the photograph?
             From the photograph, the photograph itself, no.
14
15
    can't say whether any metadata was removed or not because I
16
     can't tell from this.
17
             So, to your knowledge nothing was removed from the
    photograph when it was shared here?
18
19
         Α.
             That's correct.
             Sorry. Can you answer?
20
         Q.
             That's correct.
21
         Α.
22
             Thank you.
         Q.
23
             MR. ALLAN: Let her finish the question. Take your
24
     time.
25
         Α.
             Sorry.
```

1	Q.	Okay. So, you said earlier that in December 2018 you
2	decided	to apply for a copyright registration, correct?
3	А.	Yes.
4	Q.	Okay. You applied for two copyright registrations; is
5	that co	rrect?
6	Α.	That is correct.
7	Q.	Okay. What was wrong with the first application?
8	Α.	My legal counsel said that
9		MR. ALLAN: Objection and don't say what your legal
10	counsel	said.
11	Q.	I'm not asking for what your legal counsel told you.
12	I'm ask	ing for your understanding of why you decided to file
13	for a s	econd application?
14	. A.	It was on the advice can I say that?
15		MR. ALLAN: No.
16	А.	No. I don't know how to answer the question then.
17		MR. ALLAN: Well, do you know why? Can we take a
18	break?	
19	Q.	I would prefer to finish the answer to the question.
20		MR. ALLAN: If you can answer the question without
21	disclos	ing communications that you had with counsel, go ahead
22	and ans	wer the question. If you can't without disclosing what
23	you tal	ked about with counsel, then I advise you not to answer
24	the que	stion.
25	A.	Then I can't answer the question.

```
1
                    The fact that you spoke with counsel is not
2
    privileged, merely the substance.
             MR. ALLAN: Well, I think we're talking about the
3
    substance.
4
5
             Okay. You have no independent knowledge for why you
6
    applied for a second copyright application?
7
         Α.
             That is correct.
             Okay. Would you still like to take a break?
8
         Ο.
9
             MR. ALLAN: I don't think so. I think we have just
     covered it.
10
11
         Q.
             Okay.
         Α.
12
             Yeah.
                    So we have Exhibit 25.
13
         Ο.
             Okay.
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 25 is
14
                                  marked for identification.)
15
16
         Q. Exhibit 25 is a copyright application dated December
17
     14th, 2018?
18
         Α.
             Yes.
                    So, this was your application that you sent in
19
             Okav.
20
     on your own?
21
             It does appear to be.
         Α.
22
         Q.
             Okay.
23
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 26 is
                                  marked for identification.)
24
             Exhibit 26, this is the public catalog of the
25
```

```
copyright registration Wrong on Many Levels, correct?
1
             Correct.
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 27 is
3
                                  marked for identification.)
4
             Exhibit 27, this is the Certificate of Registration,
5
     correct?
6
             That is correct.
7
         Α.
             Okay. You stated on here this was not a work made for
8
 9
     hire and that you are the author, correct?
             That is correct.
10
         Α.
             Okay.
11
         0.
                                  (Whereupon, Defendant's 28 is
12
                                  marked for identification.)
13
14
             Exhibit 28 is a Certification of Registration marked
15
     VA 2-133-725, correct?
         Α.
             Correct.
16
             It is dated as the Effective Date of Registration is
17
     January 3rd, 2019, correct?
18
19
         Α.
             Correct.
             Okay. The Title of Work is 12082017knives. Did you
20
     select that title?
2.1
             No, I did not.
22
         Α.
                    This identifies you as the author of the
23
         0.
     photograph, correct?
24
25
         Α.
             Correct.
```

- Q. Okay. Do you recall what you intended to do with this copyright registration?
 - A. This, the first or the second?
 - Q. The second.

4

5

6

9

- A. That was part of the whole copyright procedure so I could defend my work.
- Q. Okay. Did you intend to make T shirts with this copyright registration?
 - A. I have thought about it.
- 10 | Q. When did you think about it?
- 11 A. Probably a year and a half ago but I can't say for 12 certain.
- Q. Okay. So, you testified earlier that you did not intend to do anything with the photograph in December of 2017, correct?
- 16 A. At that point, yes, that's correct.
- Q. So, at some point in time you thought you might do something with it?
- 19 A. Yes.

- Q. Okay. What prompted this decision?
- 21 A. The fact that there were 20,000 shares.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Approximately.
- Q. Why T shirts?
- A. I had done T shirts for a family reunion so I knew

1	something about how to do them so I thought that would be good
2	since I knew something about it but that's the only thing that
3	came to mind.

- Q. Have you ever made T shirts for public sale before?
- A. Public sale before this, yes.
- Q. When was that?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- A. In either, yeah, November of 2019.
- Q. So, not prior to December 2018?
- A. No, that is not correct. I had also done some several years ago with CafePress for a couple different things that I thought were funny.
- 12 Q. Can you describe those T shirts to me, please?
 - A. At this point, no, I cannot. I do not remember them.
 - Q. But you believe that several years ago you used CafePress to make T shirts?
 - A. I didn't make any because I didn't sell any, so I made them available for sale.
 - Q. Okay. So, have you ever sold T shirts for public purchase?
 - A. Most recently, yes.
 - Q. Okay. What was that?
- A. The fires that happened in northern California, they
 were stopped a quarter of a mile from my house so I made
 T shirts for a fundraiser for Cal Fire.

- 1 Q. Okay. When was that?
- 2 A. This would be in November of 2019.
- Q. Okay. So, you said that the idea for T shirts with the photograph occurred to you about a year and a half ago?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. So, prior to November 2019?
- 7 A. Right.
- Q. So, at the time that this application was made, you had never sold T shirts before, correct?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 Q. Have you made any T shirts with the photograph?
- 12 A. Not yet.
- Q. Have you taken any steps in order to sell T shirts with the photograph?
- 15 A. Yes.

- Q. Can you describe those steps for me, please?
- 17 A. I learned how to set up a Custom Ink account for the 18 T shirts I described about Cal Fire.
- 19 Q. So, you have established an account?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Have you uploaded the photograph to that account?
- 22 A. Not yet.
- Q. Okay. You did not disclose any of that in your interrogatories. Is there a reason?
 - A. I believe it is in the interrogatories where I talk

2.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

18

21

22

23

2.4

25

about how I have looked at doing the Custom Ink.

- Q. Okay. Did you intend to sell the photograph through the medium of T shirts via third-party Custom Ink as your response to interrogatory number four in Exhibit 2, is that what you're referring to?
 - A. I believe so, yes.
- Q. Okay. You did not disclose that you have an actual account with them yet, correct?
- A. When I answered those interrogatories I had not set up the account yet.
 - Q. When did you set up that account?
- 12 A. A couple days after actually I had answered the
 13 interrogatories because that was when I, yes, after we moved
 14 back in after the evacuation from the fires.
 - Q. If you can pick up Exhibit 2, please, and go to page nine, do you see that that verification page is dated December 6, 2019, correct?
 - A. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. December 6, 2019 is after November 2019, correct?
 - A. That's correct.
 - Q. Okay. So, as of December 6, 2019 when you verified that the answers in this interrogatory request were true and complete, had you already created a Custom Ink account?
 - A. Yes, I had.

- 1 Why did you verify -- why did you not disclose that as of the date of your verification? 2
 - I believe the response that I had given was sufficient, that I had been looking into Custom Ink. I didn't give all of the details to it but I didn't think the details of having set up a Custom Ink account was relevant.
 - Q. Okay. Mr. Bradley, when did you respond to these interrogatories?
 - Let's see. I received them it would be I believe it was the first Sunday in November.
 - Q. Okay.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

15

16

17

19

20

21.

22

- It might have been the second Sunday. 1.2
- 1.3 Do you recall making changes to the interrogatory Q. 14 responses?
 - I made one change because I left off one word.
 - Okay. Do you remember making any changes after last 0. Thursday?
- 18 Α. Yes. It was one word.
 - Mr. Bradley, you see that this Exhibit 2 is titled Plaintiff Matthew Bradley's Superseding Answers and Objections to Defendant's First Set of Interrogatories?
 - Α. Yes.
- 23 Do you understand that you have submitted two 0. Okav. 24 sets of responses to these interrogatories?
 - I understand you are saying that. Α.

	PAGE 1, MATTHEW OIL 12/12/2019
1	Q. Okay. Do you recall seeing two different sets of
2	interrogatory responses?
3	A. That were submitted to you?
4	Q. Uh-huh.
5	A. No, I do not.
6	Q. Okay. So, you do not remember seeing a new set of
7	interrogatory responses that were given to you to sign a
8	verification page for last Thursday or Friday?
9	A. Yes, but I did not know that they were submitted to
10	you, the first set.
11	Q. Okay. So, I'm going to ask you to please look through
12	these responses that are here in Exhibit 2, just confirm to me
13	that when you signed that verification you had actually seen
14	every single one of these responses because some of them are
15	materially different from the first set that was produced?
16	A. Yes, I have seen them and that is what I fixed with I
17	believe the one word.
18	Q. Okay. And we can get the original set that was
19	produced. More than one word was changed.
20	A. I don't know if you can or not.
21	Q. Okay. Can we take a break?
22	(Whereupon, a recess was taken.)
23	Q. Okay. Thank you for taking that moment.
24	(Whereupon Defendant's 29 is

marked for identification.)

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

- Q. Mr. Bradley, you will see that Exhibit 29 is titled Plaintiff Matthew Bradley's Answers and Objections to Defendant's First Set of Interrogatories, where as Exhibit 2 identifies that as the superseding answers and objections, correct?
 - A. Yep. Correct.
- Q. Okay. Make sure we're on the same page here. You mentioned a moment ago that you were not aware that this first document of Exhibit 29 was produced; is that correct?
 - A. No. I said I wasn't aware that you had it.
- Q. Okay. Fair enough. So you were not aware that it had been sent to counsel for defendant?
 - A. Correct.
 - Q. Okay. If you can please look at page seven of both Exhibit 2 and Exhibit 29?
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 All right. If you look at interrogatory number 13, it 18 asks you to describe the fee arrangement between you and 19 Liebowitz Law Firm, PLLC, Clements Bernard Walker, and Allan IP Litigation, and identify the payer of fees and costs for 20 legal services in connection with this action, and then you 21 22 see on Exhibit 29 that the answer is, "Plaintiff objects to 23 interrogatory number 13 on grounds of attorney/client privilege. Accordingly, no further notice is required", 2.4 25 correct?

- A. That's correct.
- Q. All right. Then if you can look over at the
- 3 | superseding responses, Exhibit 2, same interrogatory number
- 4 | 13, you can see the response now to interrogatory number 13
- 5 | says, "Plaintiff has retained Liebowitz Law Firm, PLLC, the
- 6 | firm, to enforce his copyrights under a contingency fee
- 7 | arrangement, the Firm advances all costs associated with the
- 8 | litigation and then deducts such costs from the proceeds of
- 9 | litigation", correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 | Q. Did you make that change?
- 12 A. That's an attorney/client privilege I believe.
- MR. ALLAN: She just asked if you made that change.
- 14 | That's a yes or no.
- 15 A. Okay. I was making sure I understood. No, I did
- 16 | not.

- 17 Q. Okay. Were you aware of that change?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. Thank you. Okay. Let's go back to T shirts.
- 20 How has Analytical Grammar's post impacted your efforts to
- 21 | sell T shirts?
- 22 A. It has not.
- Q. Okay. Because you had not yet made efforts to sell
- 24 | T shirts?
- 25 A. That's correct.

When did you first contact somebody asking them 1 Okay. 2 to remove the photograph from the internet? I believe that would have been December 2018. 3 Okay. So, you don't recall any earlier incident of 4 Q. asking somebody to remove the photograph? 5 I do not recall. 6 Α. 7 Q. Okay. 8 (Whereupon, Defendant's 30 and 31 are marked for identification.) 9 10 Q. Exhibit 30 and 31 are emails you sent, one to 11 imqur.com and the other to Reddit, correct? That's correct. 12 Α. 13 The imqur email is dated December 14th and the Reddit 14 email is dated December 17th, correct? 15 Α. Correct. Okay. Do you recall any other emails you sent to 16 17 third parties prior to these two? 1.8 Emails, no, I do not recall any emails. 19 Do you recall any other forms of communications? Q. 20 Α. There were a couple around the same time. There were a total of five. 21 22 Q. Who were they to? 23 I don't recall. Α. 2.4 What was their format? Q. The format of what? 25 Α.

	BRADLEY, M	ATTHEW on 12/12/2019	Page 6
1	Q.	The format of those communications?	
2	A.	Their web page had a comment submission form.	
3	Q.	Did you receive a confirmation from those web page	ges?
4	A.	No, I did not.	
5	Q.	Okay. You don't recall what those other three	
6	website	s were?	
7	A.	I do not recall what they are, what they were,	
8	no.		
9	Q.	Okay. Do you remember when you made them?	
10	Α.	It would have been about the same time as these	ones,
11	Decembe	r 2018.	
12	Q.	What did you do to try to identify those other to	hree
13	web pag	es?	
14	A.	I had done a Google image search and they came up	p.
15	Q.	Okay. What efforts did you make after receiving	the
16	request	for production of documents and interrogatories	to
17	remembe	r or identify those other three web pages?	
18	A.	I have them in a Word document and I sent that to	o my
19	attorne	у.	
2.0	Q.	You had a Word document with five different web	pages
21	you con	tacted?	
22	A.	Three other ones. These two are	
23	Q.	Three in addition to imgur and Reddit?	

Α.

Yes.

24

25

That was not produced and we need to see that.

1		(Whereupon, Defendant's 32 is
2		marked for identification.)
3	Q.	All right. Exhibit 32 is a response you received from
4	Reddit	legal support and then your response to it as well?
5	А.	Yes.
6	Q.	Did you receive any other responses to those total of
7	five in	quiries that you sent?
8	Α.	Not that I'm aware of.
9	Q.	Okay. Did you follow up with any of those five?
10	Α.	Directly, no.
11	Q.	Okay. So, between December of 2018 and the present,
12	you hav	e not followed up with any of those?
13	А.	No. Directly with them, no.
14	Q.	Okay. So, you have referred them to counsel?
15	Α.	Correct.
16	Q.	All five of them?
17	А.	Yes.
18	Q.	Okay. You still cannot remember the other three?
19	A.	I don't remember off hand, no, I don't.
20	Q.	Okay. And you don't recall whether any of the five,
21	other t	han this response from Reddit, responded?
22	A.	If I recall correctly one of the other ones did
23	message	me a chat message saying that they would remove it,
24	but I m	ay be mistaken at that point. I may be mistaken.
25	Q.	Okay. Your post, the photograph, excuse me, was
	l	

- 1 | shared many more than five times in five places, correct?
- 2 A. As far as I know, it was shared from my Facebook page,
- 3 | that's what I know, is 20,000 times and now I see on the
- 4 | Analytical Grammar one it was shared 13,000 times. Those are
- 5 | the only places where I know that it has been shared.
- Q. Okay. You're referring to the Facebook post being
- 7 | shared on Facebook, correct?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. Okay. The photograph, you stated that you did a
- 10 | Google image search?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And saw that the photograph was showing up on many,
- 13 | many websites separate from Facebook, correct?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 | O. More than five?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Okay. Did you reach out to every single one of those
- 18 organizations?
- 19 | A. No.
- 20 Q. Okay. Did you reach any licensing agreements with any
- 21 | third parties to use the photograph?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Did you reach any other type of agreement with third
- 24 parties to use the photograph?
- 25 A. No.

1	Q.	Other than the five web pages you have already
2	identifi	led, did you reach out to any other third parties to
3	attempt	to arrange an agreement or license for use of the
4	photogra	aph?
5	Α.	Not that I recall.
6	Q.	Okay. When did you decide to sue Analytical Grammar?
7	A.	I believe that's in the response. The date on it I
8	believe	was June of 2019. I know it's in the interrogatories.
9	I can't	remember the exact date but I did have an email when I
10	responde	ed to them which gave the time stamp on there.
11		(Whereupon, Defendant's 33 is
12	!	marked for identification.)
13	Q.	Is that the email you're remembering?
14	A.	Yes. June 2019, that's correct.
15	Q.	This is not an email from you, correct?
16	Α.	No. This is the email that was sent from my law firm,
17	my legal	l counsel.
18		MR. ALLAN: This was sent by your legal counsel to
19	you?	
20	Α.	Yes.
21		MR. ALLAN: Okay. This shouldn't I'm going to ask
22	to have	this attorney/client privileged information.
23	Q.	Well, let me ask this, were they your legal counsel at
24	the time	e you received this?
25	A.	Yes.

	BKAULEY, W	ATTHEW ON 12/12/2019 Page 7.
1	Q.	You had already hired them when you received this
2	email?	
3	Α.	I already said yes.
4	Q.	Okay. How did you learn about Mr. Liebowitz?
5	А.	Google search.
6	Q.	What did you search?
7	A.	DRM attorney I believe.
8	Q.	Okay. What did that mean to you?
9	Α.	Digital rights management attorneys.
10	Q.	What were you looking for in an attorney?
11	А.	Someone who would take care of things like this.
12	Q.	Define like this?
13	A.	Like those first five. I just didn't want to do it on
14	my own	and so I wanted someone to take care of it for me.
15	Q.	Okay. When did you decide to hire counsel or to
16	researc	h counsel first?
17	A.	December 2018 shortly after I sent those five, after
18	the cop	yright and after I sent those five companies emails or
19	message	s.
20	Q.	Okay. Did you spend those six months in between
21	Decembe	r 2018 and June 10, 2019 researching?
22	A.	I'm not sure I understand your question. I did other
23	things.	I mean, not the entire six months. I occasionally
24	looked	into it but I essentially let the law firm take care of

Yes, but so in between December 2018 and June 10, 1 Ο. 2 2019, did you look at other law firms? 3 Α. No. What were you looking for in counsel? 4 Q. Okay. Someone who would take care of this for me. 5 Α. 6 Okay. What does take care of this for you mean to Q. 7 you? Pursue any legal remedies that were appropriate. 8 Α. Why pursue Analytical Grammar? 9 Q. Because it was suggested as one of the, one of the 10 places that infringed on my copyright. 11 Were you aware of Analytical Grammar before this June 12 13 10th email? 14 Α. No. Have you initiated lawsuits against anyone else for 15 use of the photograph? 16 They have been initiated. 17 Α. MR. ALLAN: Answer the question. 18 19 Okay. Just making sure. MR. ALLAN: Listen to the question. Just answer the 20 21 question. Α. 2.2 Yes. 23 How many? Q. Okay. 24 I don't know off hand. Α. Fewer than ten? 25 Q.

1	A. Yes.
2	Q. Okay. Are you, were you aware of the defendants in
3	those lawsuits prior to notification from any third party?
4	A. No.
5	Q. Okay. As you saw in Exhibit 2, the superseding
6	interrogatory responses, interrogatory 13
7	MR. ALLAN: Before we get off topic, based upon what I
8	have heard, he indicated that he was represented by
9.	Mr. Liebowitz at the time of this email so I'm going to ask
10	that we claw back document MB 087.

- MS. LAWSON: Understood. We'll have to confirm with the privilege log that was produced in the case just to check that time line, but if that's true, of course.
- Q. So, Exhibit 2, the interrogatory responses, you saw that one of the changes was to interrogatory 13. So, you understand that you have a contingency fee arrangement, correct?
 - A. Correct.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

2.4

- Q. Okay. What is your understanding of what that means?
- A. Contingency fees, for example, there is a certain amount of, for example, if the case goes forward and a certain amount of money is settled on or set by the courts, then the fee, there is certain fees that come out of that and then a percentage goes to the attorney and a percentage goes to me.

1	Q. Okay. What is the split that you have agreed to?		
2	MR. ALLAN: Objection. I'm going to advise you not to		
3	answer that on the grounds it's attorney/client		
4	communication.		
5	MS. LAWSON: Fee arrangements are typically in the 4th		
6	Circuit allowed to be disclosed and held to be not privileged.		
7	MR. ALLAN: Can you show me something on that? You		
8	may be right. I don't come across this as an issue typically,		
9	so.		
10	MS. LAWSON: We'll check into that.		
11	(Whereupon, Defendant's 34 is		
12	marked for identification.)		
13	Q. You produced Exhibit 34 identifying it as August 2019		
14	One Deleted Comment. What is this?		
15	A. Someone, a supporter of Analytical Grammar had left a		
16	very nasty remark there and I was attempting to recreate it.		
17	I thought I had. I had not so you can't really see what it		
18	is.		
19	Q. Okay. This was a post that you made?		
20	A. A share I had made from Blanca Perla.		
21	Q. Got you. You said that somebody from Analytical		
22	Grammar made a comment?		
23	A. No. A supporter.		
24	Q. A supporter.		
25	A. I believe it's a supporter just because of the		
	l la companya di managantan di managantan di managantan di managantan di managantan di managantan di managanta		

- 1 language. I believe she even said something about Analytical
 2 Grammar. I can't remember the exact words.
 - Q. Okay.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

18

19

20

21

22

23

2.4

- A. And I was annoyed and deleted it.
- Q. Do you believe that this person is associated with Analytical Grammar?
- A. I don't know.
 - Q. Okay. You stated in your complaint, I believe in your interrogatories which, yes, if you can go to page six of Exhibit 2?
- 11 A. Okay.
- Q. If you look at your response to interrogatory 9, you say that although Plaintiff cannot state with certainty about their relation to the Defendant, Plaintiff has received numerous insulting remarks from people who he assumes are favoring the Defendant. What is the basis for that assumption?
 - A. Frequently these remarks mention Analytical Grammar.
 - Q. Okay. Do you have any basis to believe that they are associated with Analytical Grammar?
 - A. Associated, what do you mean by associated?
 - Q. That they are personally connected to Analytical Grammar. Let me ask it a different way. Do you have any basis to believe that Analytical Grammar's employees have been posting insulting remarks on your Facebook?

		, age /
1	Α.	No.
2	Q.	Do you have any basis to believe that relatives of
3	employe	es of Analytical Grammar have been posting on your
4	Faceboo	k?
5	Α.	I don't know. One way or the other, I do not know.
6	Q.	So, you have no basis for an affirmative belief?
7	Α.	No. No. No.
8	Q.	Do you have any basis for the belief that customers of
9	Analyti	cal Grammar are posting on your Facebook?
10	A.	Yes because some of the remarks I have seen have
11	referen	ced something like that.
12	Q.	Referenced that they were customers of Analytical
13	Grammar	?
14	A.	I believe so.
15	Q.	Okay. Do you know where those comments are?
16	Α.	Yes.
17	Q.	Where?
18	Α.	On Analytical Grammar's GoFundMe Facebook page.
19	Q.	Okay. So, not on your Facebook page?
20	Α.	That's correct.
21	Q.	Okay. So, you are not aware of any customers of
22	Analyti	cal Grammar posting insulting comments on your Facebook
23	page?	

25

say they were customers, if I recall correctly, but they would

A. No, that's not correct. What I'm saying is they would

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1.2

13

14

15

1.6

17

18

19

2.0

21

22

23

24

25

say something about the fact that they were customers on
Analytical Grammar's web page and then they would comment on
mine.

- Q. The same people?
- A. I believe so.
- Q. Okay. Have you identified those people in your production?
 - A. No. I didn't think it was relevant.
- Q. Interrogatory number 9 asks you to describe with particularity all communications you have had with third parties related to the photograph, Defendant and/or this action, and you're telling me that there are comments that have been made on your Facebook, so communications?
- A. Yes.
 - Q. From people you believe to be customers that you have not, of Analytical Grammar, that you have not identified?
- A. That's correct.
 - Q. Okay. So, when your response to interrogatory number 9 does not actually name anybody or point to any examples in your production of individuals who have said that that you believe are customers, that answer to that interrogatory number 9 is not true?
 - MR. ALLAN: Objection.
 - A. No. No, that's not true.
 - Q. Okay. Why is it not true?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

2.0

21

2.2

23

24

A. Because, as I have said, they left the remarks on my
web page, my Facebook page, and looking at the Analytical
Grammar page, I saw that they were customers of Analytical
Grammar or friends of Analytical Grammar or whatever. They
were third parties and I produced all of that, including the
one deleted comment which that's where it was.

- Q. Okay. But the deleted comment does not show anybody making an insulting comment to you?
- A. No, it doesn't but I was trying to produce every place where I had seen remarks like that.
- Q. Okay. What else have you produced that shows the insulting comments that you're referring to?
- A. They're in the comments on the drills, for examples, and also in the original posting. I believe that you have that as the large exhibit. It would be maybe Exhibit 3 I believe.
- Q. Yes. Mr. Bradley, I am aware that there are comments that could be perceived as insulting potentially.
 - A. Yes.
- Q. What I'm asking you is have you actually described the individuals that you believe have done that and described the basis of your belief for their connection to Analytical Grammar?
- A. I believe I have gone over that. I believe that I have seen the same names on Analytical Grammar's Facebook page

and then commenting on mine and they also left very insulting remarks on the Analytical Grammar page about me.

- Q. Okay. If you can again look at page six of the interrogatory?
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. Look at response to interrogatory number 9.
- 7 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q. Does that response describe any of the information that you just conveyed to me?
- A. The part that's on my Facebook page because it says particularly all communications you have had with third parties. That's all included in those documents.
- Q. Okay. So, other than the documents you have produced to us, you are not aware of any of those communications?
- A. There are no other communications. No one has communicated in any way with me.
- Q. Okay. And the exclusive basis for your belief that some of those are customers of Analytical Grammar is a connection you have independently made between looking at posts on Analytical Grammar's Facebook page and your posts?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 | Q. Okay.
- 23 A. And I may be wrong.
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. It's just my belief.

4

5

8

9

10

11

15

16

18

19

20

21

- Q. Okay. All right. Let's take a seven minute break.
 (Whereupon, a recess was taken.)
 - Q. Mr. Bradley, what is your contingency fee arrangement with your counsel?
 - A. Honestly, I don't remember the details, I don't.
- Q. Okay. So, you don't remember whether it's 60/40, 70/30, any of that split?
 - A. I don't remember, no.
 - Q. Okay. We'll follow up with an interrogatory. Last question, why did you choose to use a contingency fee?
 - A. It seemed easy.
- 12 Q. Okay. What was easy about it?
- A. It's a very straightforward arrangement so I didn't have to worry about it.
 - Q. What would you worry about with a different fee arrangement?
- A. Depending on the arrangement.
 - Q. If you were to be paying your attorney by the hour, what would your worry be?
 - A. I would worry about how honest my attorney is and whether he's just trying to run up the bill.
- Q. And if you were to pay per proceeding, what would you worry about?
- 24 A. Same thing.
 - Q. So, a payment per proceeding is a fixed cost to go

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

through a complaint or a motion to dismiss or a certain point in time in litigation, so it's unrelated to how many hours the attorney works on the matter.

- A. That's correct.
- Q. What about that would worry you?
- A. Again, same thing, that there would be all kinds of motions, all kinds of proceedings and I would end up paying for each and every one of them and, you know, the attorney could run up the bill that way.
- Q. Okay. If it were an arrangement that was X number of dollars from filing the complaint through the finish of the case, never going to be changed no matter how much work was done on it, what would you worry about it then?
- A. That would depend on X. If X is \$10 it's one thing.

 If it's \$10,000 it is entirely different.
 - Q. If it is whatever amount you thought reasonable?
 - A. I would have to consider it, but no one made that offer so I didn't consider it.
 - Q. Okay. My question though is you said that the contingency fee arrangement means it's something you don't have to worry about.
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. I'm trying to understand the nature and scope of your worry through non contingency fee arrangements?
 - A. Because in a contingency fee, all of the money goes to

1	the lawyer first and then I get whatever I'm supposed to get
2	after that. I don't have to put money up front. I don't have
3	to pay money regularly. It's all very simple.
4	Q. So, you don't have to bear the risk?
5	A. Well, it's kind of a shared risk in many ways.
6	Q. Okay. You are not risking your money up front?
7	A. That's also true. I hadn't really thought of that but
8	that's also true.
9	MS. LAWSON: All right. I think we are done for
10	today. I'm going to hold this deposition open, however,
11	because there is going to need to be a supplementation of
12	document production. Those documents should be sufficient but
13	obviously we don't know what is going to happen.
14	MR. ALLAN: Well, I guess that's between you and
15	Mr. Liebowitz at the appropriate time. We're here for up to
16	seven hours. I understand your issues so let's just say I
17	object to that, but I understand. I have no questions. We
18	would like to read and sign.
19	
20	(Whereupon, at 12:33 P.M., the deposition in the
21	above-entitled matter ceased.)
22	
23	
24	
25	

DEPOSITION ERRATA SHEET		
Date Taken: December 12, 2019		
Witness: Matthew Bradley		
I, Matthew Bradley, do hereby certify that I have		
read the foregoing transcript of my testimony, and further		
certify that it is a true and accurate record of my testimony		
(with the exception of the corrections listed below):		
Page Line Correction		
<u> </u>		
WITNESS my hand and seal on this the day of		
, 2019.		
WITNESS SIGNATURE		
This deposition certificate was signed in my presence by		
on the of, 2019.		
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
NOTARY PUBLIC		
NOTARY NO My Commission expires:		

1	CERTIFICATE OF COURT REPORTER
2	North Carolina
3	Wake County
4	I, Kathleen M. Van Voorhis, Notary Public in and for the
5	State of North Carolina, certify that on December 12, 2019, in
6	Raleigh, North Carolina, Matthew Bradley, produced to me
7	satisfactory evidence of identification and was duly sworn by
8	me prior to the taking of the foregoing deposition to tell the
9	truth, thereupon testified as set forth in the preceding
10	pages, exclusive of errata sheet and signature page, if
11	required, the examination being reported by me in stenotype
12	and reduced to typewritten form by me personally.
13	I further certify that I am not of counsel or in the
14	employ of the parties to this action; that I am not related by
15	blood or connected by marriage to the parties of this action;
16	that I am not interested in the outcome thereof; that the
17	foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of said proceeding
18	to the best of my ability and understanding.
19	This the 23rd day of December, 2019.
20	
21	Kathy Van Voorhis
22	KATHLEEN M. VAN VOORHIS
23	Registered Professional Reporter
24	Notary Public, #19971530155
25	

Exhibits	Exhibit 33 4:23 Exhibit 34 4:24 75:13	17 3:17 4:7 22:19,21 29:23 35:12 37:22 40:18 47:21
	EXHIBIT 34 4:24 /5:13	17th 67:14
Exhibit 1 3:13 Exhibit 2 3:14 9:12,24 10:1 48:7	0	18 3:18,19,20 4:8 29:23 37:12
53:13 62:4,15 63:19 64:12 65:3, 15 66:3 74:5,14 76:10	0010 49:7	39:24 19 3:21 4:9 41:13 42:3,10 45:8
Exhibit 3 3:15 9:15 44:16 79:15	0036 35:17	46:2,25
Exhibit 4 3:16 14:23	0072 36:9	19,000 30:20
Exhibit 5 3:17	014 26:25	1994 8:11
Exhibit 6 3:18 18:3,13,20	026 27:8	1998 8:11
Exhibit 7 3:19 18:12	040 29:7	1st 18:4
Exhibit 8 3:20 18:19	058 39:7	
Exhibit 9 3:21	063 47:20,23	2
Exhibit 10 3:22	066 49:5	2 3:14 9:1,12,24 10:1 48:7 53:13
Exhibit 11 3:23 26:4 47:21	071 40:10	62:4,15 63:19 64:12 65:3,15 66:3 74:5,14 76:10
50:10,11 52:25	087 74:10	2-133-725 58:15
Exhibit 12 3:24 33:23	,	20 3:22 4:10 34:1 43:15
Exhibit 13 4:3 35:12	1	20,000 59:21 70:3
Exhibit 14 4:4 38:16	1 3:13 5:11	2012/3/9 17:16
Exhibit 15 4:5	10 3:22 20:23 72:21 73:1	2016 18:4
Exhibit 16 4:6	100 29:11	2017 17:23 18:7,15,21 22:24
Exhibit 17 4:7	10:00 5:1,19	24:18 27:24 29:4 30:1 38:8,21
Exhibit 18 4:8	10:48 50:3	49:6,16,19,24 51:10 55:8 59:14
Exhibit 19 4:9 42:3,10 45:8	10th 73:13	2018 29:3,4 30:11 33:21 34:2 35:8,14 43:12 48:8,20 50:2 51:11
46:2,25 E xhibit 20 4:10	11 3:23 22:17 26:4 47:21 50:10,11 52:25 53:22	53:2 56:1 57:17 60:8 67:3 68:11 69:11 72:17,21 73:1
Exhibit 21 4:11	11:31 49:20	2019 36:7 37:12 58:18 60:7 61:2,
Exhibit 22 4:12 49:5	12 3:24 33:23,24	6 62:17,19,22 71:8,14 72:21 73:2 75:13
Exhibit 23 4:13 49:6,14	12,000 30:14	21 4:11 48:12
Exhibit 24 4:14	12082017knives 58:20	22 3:23 4:12 44:19,24 45:6 46:19
Exhibit 25 4:15 57:13,16	13 4:3 35:10,12 52:22 65:17,23	49:2,4,5
Exhibit 26 4:16 57:25	66:4 74:6,15	23 4:13 49:2,4,6,14
Exhibit 27 4:17 58:5	13,000 33:11 70:4	24 4:14 55:6
Exhibit 28 4:18 58:14	14 3:16 4:4 36:5 38:10,16	25 4:15 57:13,14,16
Exhibit 29 4:19 65:1,9,15,22	14th 49:19,24 50:2 57:17 67:13	26 4:16 36:7 57:23,25
Exhibit 30 4:20 67:10	15 4:5 36:19 38:10	27 4:17 35:14 58:3,5
Exhibit 31 4:21	15th 11:25 48:20	28 4:18 58:12,14
Exhibit 32 4:22 69:3	16 4:6 37:9 38:11 55:8	29 4:19 31:11,19 64:24 65:1,9,15, 22

Index: 0010..29

^	— 69 4:22	adding 50:19
3		addition 51:4,17 68:23
3 3:15 9:5,15 44:16 79:15	7	adjunct 12:20
30 4:20 67:8,10	7 3:19 18:10,12	advances 66:7
30th 9:22	70 40:1	advice 56:14
31 4:21 67:8,10	70/30 81:7	advise 56:23 75:2
32 4:22 69:1,3	71 4:23	affect 6:15
33 3:24 4:23 71:11	74 4:20	affirmative 77:6
34 4:24 75:11,13	75 4:24	affixed 25:3
35 4:3	7th 29:17	AG 35:17 36:9 49:7
36 4:4,5		agree 21:11 54:9
37 4:6,7	8	agreed 75:1
39 4:8	8 3:20 18:17,19	agreement 70:23 71:3
3rd 58:18	8th 29:18 49:16	agreements 70:20
		ahead 6:24 26:8 56:21
4	9	aim 45:3
4 3:16 14:21,23	9 3:14,15,21 19:7 76:12 78:9,19,	Allan 5:18 25:20 26:10 40:24
41 4:9 30:7 31:8	22 80:6	43:10 44:23,25 47:22 49:11 52:1 4 55:23 56:9,15,17,20 57:3,9
43 4:10 32:24	93 7:14	65:19 66:13 71:18,21 73:18,20
48 4:11	96 7:14	74:7 75:2,7 78:23
49 4:12,13	9th 17:17	allowed 75:6
4th 75:5		amount 74:22,23
	A	amusing 17:5
5	A.M . 5:1 49:20	Analytical 49:7 55:8 66:20 70:4 71:6 73:9,12 75:15,21 76:1,6,18,
5 3:7,13,17 17:13	ability 6:16 23:6	20,22,24 77:3,9,12,18,22 78:2,16
51 37:14	account 12:10,14,16,19 13:16	79:2,3,4,22,25 80:2,18,20
55 4:14	21:9,23 61:17,19,21 62:8,10,11, 24 63:6	and/or 78:11
57 4:15,16	accounting 51:25 52:16	Angie 29:8
58 4:17,18		annoyed 32:3 52:16,20 76:4
5:02 49:16	accounts 12:7 13:8 accurate 33:8	answering 9:23 18:24
	acted 43:25 44:10	answers 3:15 6:5,13 8:24 9:25 52:1 53:14 62:23 63:20 65:2,4
6	action 65:21 78:12	App 13:15,16
6 2.40 40.4 2.42 20 60.47 40 22		appearance 16:1
6 3:18 18:1,3,13,20 62:17,19,22 60/40 81:6	activity 21:14 actual 48:1,22 51:4 62:7	appeared 54:11
64 4:19	· ·	appears 18:12 22:23 26:19 27:11
	add 31:6 49:20,24 50:21,22	35:21 36:10 48:7 50:10 55:12
67 4:21	added 50:3,7	application 4:15 21:5 53:4 56:7,

Index: applied..clever

13 57:6,16,19 61:8

applied 56:4 57:6

apply 56:2

Approximately 59:23

apps 12:24

April 34:1

arrange 71:3

arrangement 65:18 66:7 74:16 81:3,13,16,17

arrangements 75:5

article 4:3,4,10 34:8,22,24,25 35:3,12 36:2,7,16 37:11 38:11

43:17

articles 35:6 38:11,15

asks 44:19 65:18 78:9

association 42:6

assume 5:14 16:5 32:6

assumed 15:17 32:19,20

assumes 76:15

assumption 32:22 76:17

attach 24:25

attempt 46:271:3

attempting 75:16

attorney 52:2,7,8 68:19 72:7,10

74:25 81:18.20

attorney/client 65:23 66:12

71:22 75:3

attorneys 72:9

attribution 15:13,19 54:16

August 18:4 36:7 75:13

author 14:10,14 15:16 16:6

23:11,16,22 54:16 58:9,23

authored 44:22 45:3

authors 38:12

authorship 23:4

aware 6:15 15:12,14 17:6 19:1,3, 9 20:18 22:12 30:5 32:1 33:20

35:6 47:5 65:8.10.11 66:17 69:8 73:12 74:2 77:21 79:17 80:14

R

back 6:4.18 19:12 33:15 35:16 39:7 48:6 53:10,13 62:14 66:19

74:10

background 5:22 7:4

based 11:22 13:6 21:16 74:7

Basically 11:22

basis 32:12 43:8 46:17 76:16,19,

24 77:2,6,8 79:22 80:17

behavior 15:3

belief 32:12 43:8 77:6,8 79:22

80:17,25

believed 33:20

Bernard 65:19

bill 81:21

biological 15:6

Blanca 75:20

blank 31:18

blocked 31:18

blog 29:10 30:12 31:6,7,14,21

49:21

boring 8:5

bother 31:3

bottle 46:4

bottom 17:15 31:11 33:15 36:9

47:24 48:23 53:23

Bradley 5:2,6,25 7:3 13:22 15:8

19:9,17 22:20 27:15 31:22 33:19

38:21 42:10 47:25 53:2,10 63:7,

19 65:1 79:17 81:3

Bradley's 63:20 65:2

break 6:23 7:1 25:23 56:18 57:8

64:21 81:1

broken 10:11

browser 10:12

built 8:2

buoys 41:17,18

busier 46:23

busy 7:8

buzzfeed 4:3 35:12 38:11

С

Cafepress 60:10,16

Cal 60:25 61:18

California 60:23

call 48:24

caption 18:5 36:10 37:1 49:25

55:10

care 51:15 72:11,14,24 73:5,6

careful 44:5,7

case 19:6,10 24:6 74:12,22

catalog 4:16 57:25

celebrated 35:3,7

celebrity 43:25 44:10

certainty 76:13

certificate 4:17,18 58:5

Certification 58:14

change 50:17,24,25 51:1,2,11

63:15 66:11,13,17

changed 5:18 64:19

changing 30:20,22

chat 69:23

check 39:10 74:12 75:10

choose 81:10

Circuit 75:6

circulating 32:17

claim 23:11,20 25:7 54:6

claiming 42:8

clarity 6:21

class 12:22

claw 74:10

cleaner 6:7

clear 5:20

cleaver 39:4

Clements 65:19

clever 34:6,15 35:13 36:8

clicked 23:10 52:13

clients 13:17 clipped 36:11 College 12:21

comment 26:16,21 27:5,6,12,13 29:8,12 30:8,9 34:13,19 39:10,17 40:10,19,20,21 46:1,2 68:2 75:14, 22 78:2 79:6,7,8

Comment.pdf 4:24

commentary 40:5

commented 27:11 39:14 43:21

commenting 27:18 32:25 80:1

comments 25:24 27:15 30:2 77:15,22 78:12 79:12,13,17

communicated 80:16

communication 12:25 75:4

communications 12:22 13:3 43:11 52:2,7 56:21 67:19 68:1 78:10,13 80:11,14,15

companies 72:18

complaint 3:22 10:13 12:11 19:6,9,18 20:4 23:14 48:7 76:8

complete 6:13 62:24 complicated 11:14

computer 9:25 10:3 19:24

concept 13:23

concerned 32:1,7

conditions 21:13

conduct 20:18

confirm 5:10 21:22 23:9 26:18 53:17 54:10 64:12 74:11

confirmation 68:3

confirmed 10:19 22:13

confirming 29:25

connected 76:22

connection 21:8 37:17 53:25 54:7,12,17,23 65:21 79:22 80:19

connects 23:3

consideration 5:20

consultant 7:22

consumption 47:16

contact 67:1

contacted 68:21

content 21:1,2,4,7,9,10

contingency 66:6 74:16,21

81:3,10

Continued 4:1

continuing 16:14

contract 8:6,8,9

conveyed 53:24 54:7,16,23 80:9

copied 25:6,8,10,13

copy 25:15

copyright 4:15 8:21 21:25 23:21 24:15,21,24 25:3,7,12,16,17 41:1 42:24 43:6,9,13 44:5,7 48:19,22, 25 50:19,22 51:18 53:2,4 54:7,11 56:2,4 57:6,16 58:1 59:2,5,8 72:18 73:11

copyrighted 40:21 43:3,5 50:4 51:19

copyrighting 41:7 52:21

copyrights 8:18 66:6

Cornell 7:5

corner 26:13 48:23 53:1

corners 24:15

correct 10:25 16:7,24 19:3,21 20:1,14 21:14,15,23 22:24,25 24:18 25:4,9,14 29:6,15 30:2 33:21,22 34:12 35:2,21,22,24 36:1,11,14,15,24 37:4,5,18,19 40:3,12 41:11 42:7,9 43:18,19 48:9,10,23 49:17,18,21,22,25 50:1,10,15 53:5,6,11 54:4,5,13, 15,21 55:10,11,19,21 56:2,5,6 57:7 58:1,2,6,7,9,10,15,16,18,19, 24,25 59:15,16 60:9 61:9,10 62:8, 17,18,20,21 65:5,6,9,13,25 66:1, 9,10,25 67:11,12,14,15 69:15 70:1,7,8,13 71:14,15 74:17,18 77:20,24 78:17

correctly 69:22 77:25

cost 41:7 81:25

costs 41:2 65:20 66:7,8

counsel 22:16 43:11 56:8,10,11, 21,23 57:1 65:12 69:14 71:17,18, 23 72:15,16 73:4 81:4

couple 5:22 10:2 11:10 17:11 19:12 28:16,23 30:3,16 60:10 62:12 67:20

court 6:3 18:24

courts 74:23

cousin's 32:13

coverage 34:17

covered 57:10

created 17:16 19:2 28:7 41:20 44:21 45:2 46:24 62:24

creating 17:7

creative 44:21 45:2,14,16 46:8, 24 47:6

creator 35:1

credit 52:15,19

cryptic 52:1

cultural 15:7

culture 15:4,5

current 8:17

Custom 61:17 62:1,3,24 63:4,6

customers 77:8,12,21,25 78:1, 15,21 79:3 80:18

D

date 12:3 58:17 63:2 71:7,9

dated 18:4 48:20 57:16 58:17 62:16 67:13.14

dates 7:16

davs 62:12

debacle 40:15

Dec.17post.pdf 3:24

December 17:23 18:7,15,21 22:19,21,24 24:18 27:24 29:3,4, 17,18,23 30:1,10 33:21 35:8 38:8, 21 43:12 47:21 48:8,20 49:6,16, 19,23 50:2 51:10 55:8 56:1 57:16 59:14 60:8 62:16,19,22 67:3,13, 14 68:11 69:11 72:17,21 73:1

decide 51:11 71:6 72:15

decided 52:16 56:2,12

decision 59:20

deducts 66:8

defend 59:6

defendant 65:12 76:14,16 78:11

Defendant's 3:13,14,15,16,17, 18,19,20,21,22,23,24 4:3,4,5,6,7, 8,9,10,11,12,13,14,15,16,17,18, 19,20,21,22,23,24 5:11 8:24 9:1,5 14:21 17:13 18:1,10,17 19:7 20:23 22:17 33:24 35:10 36:5,19 37:9,22 39:24 41:13 43:15 48:12 49:2 55:6 57:14,23 58:3,12 63:21 64:24 65:3 67:8 69:1 71:11 75:11

defendants 74:2

defended 31:15

define 13:25 14:6 72:12

defines 15:2

definition 3:17 14:24 38:24 39:1

degree 7:5,6 delete 21:9

deleted 4:24 21:10 75:14 76:4

79:6,7

department 12:22

depend 14:10

Depending 81:17

depends 14:14

deposed 6:1

deposition 3:14 5:10,13 6:3 20:3

describe 7:4,23,24 16:17 21:25 22:5 60:12 61:16 65:18 78:9 80:8

describing 25:13

design 45:3

details 8:4 63:5 81:5

Dick 51:25 52:15

difference 48:18

Digital 72:9

DIRECT 5:5

Directly 69:10,13

disclose 43:11 52:2 61:23 62:7

63:1

disclosed 75:6

disclosing 56:21,22

discrete 15:4

document 3:18 9:15 23:7 40:1 44:19 47:21 65:9 68:18.20 74:10

documents 6:19 9:4 11:2,4,16, 17 44:20 45:1,5 68:16 80:12,13

dot 39:11

drills 40:5 41:24 79:13

driven 15:6,8

DRM 72:7 **duly** 5:3

Ε

earlier 20:12 33:19 54:11 56:1 59:13 67:4

easier 18:24

easiest 7:24 8:3

easily 29:22

easy 12:2 81:11,12

edit 4:12,13 30:10 49:5,7,9,23

edited 48:8 49:20,25

edits 48:5

educational 7:4

Effective 58:17

efforts 66:20,23 68:15

elaborate 14:15

electrical 7:8

else's 16:18

email 4:21,22,23 11:15 12:7,10, 13,16,19 67:13,14 71:9,13,15,16 72:2 73:13 74:9

emails 11:5,7,18 12:17 67:10,16, 18 72:18

employed 7:19

employees 76:24 77:3

encouraging 39:13

end 36:9

ended 17:7

ends 21:8

enforce 66:6

engineering 7:7,8

enjoy 29:10

enormous 28:25

entire 15:24 23:19 72:23

equals 17:18

essentially 72:24

established 61:19

evacuation 62:14

evolution 15:6,7

exact 71:9 76:2

Examination 3:5,7 5:5

examined 5:4

examples 13:10 17:11 78:19

79:13

excited 34:17

exclusive 80:17

excuse 53:20 69:25

exhibit 3:13,14,15,16,17,18,19, 20,21,22,23,24 4:3,4,5,6,7,8,9,10, 11,12,13,14,15,16,17,18,19,20, 21,22,23,24 9:12,15,24 10:1 14:23 18:3,12,13,19,20 19:13,15, 17 20:4 21:22 23:14 26:4 33:23 35:12 38:16 41:24 42:3,10 44:16 45:8 46:2,25 47:21 48:7 49:5,6,14 50:10,11 52:23,25 53:13 57:13, 16,25 58:5,14 62:4,15 63:19 64:12 65:1,3,9,15,22 66:3 67:10 69:3 74:5,14 75:13 76:10 79:15

Exhibits 38:10

expect 27:25 28:6,9,11,15,17,19 29:11

expected 28:14

experience 8:17

experiences 8:16,17

explain 8:4 42:21 43:1 49:9

explained 14:8

explanation 26:9 49:25

export 11:12 exported 11:7 extent 43:10

F

facebook 3:20,23 10:12,18 11:11,12,15,18,20,23,24 12:1 13:1,2,9 15:9 17:5 18:14 19:21 20:8,10,18,19 21:8,14,18,23 22:10 23:2,9 24:5,8,14 25:1,11,12 26:22,23 27:5,12,13 29:16 30:18 31:24,25 32:2,5 34:11 36:21 39:2 42:22 47:4 49:12,13 54:1,19,25 70:2,6,7,13 76:25 77:4,9,18,19,22 78:13 79:2,25 80:10,20

fact 42:21 52:8 57:1 59:21 78:1

facts 5:22

faculty 8:13 12:20

Fair 8:6 49:1 65:11

familiar 13:23

familiarize 9:7

family 59:25

famous 34:14

favoring 76:16

favorite 43:23 44:3

fee 65:18 66:6 74:16,24 75:5

81:3,10,15

feel 9:7 40:11 41:8

fees 65:20 74:21.24

Fewer 73:25

fifty 28:2,14

figure 9:11 29:24

figured 50:21

file 51:23 56:12

filed 8:21 19:10 51:22

files 11:15

find 12:2 15:25 16:12

fine 20:17 38:21 47:15,19

finish 18:23 55:23 56:19

Fire 60:25 61:18

fires 60:23 62:14

firm 65:19 66:5,6,7 71:16 72:24

firms 73:2

fittest 15:7

fixed 64:16 81:25

flattered 32:3

Fleming 47:25

flip 4:7 19:12 37:24

Fogo 29:8

folder 11:6

follow 30:17 39:14 69:9 81:9

forgotten 34:3 48:14

form 68:2

format 67:24,25 68:1

forms 67:19

forward 19:15 74:22

found 43:24 49:8 52:12

frankly 14:19

free 9:7 40:11

freelancer 8:6

frequently 17:4 46:15 76:18

fresh 10:19 26:20

Friday 64:8

friend 32:13,25 34:5

friends 20:16 31:15,17 32:18

47:9,14 79:4

front 9:25

full 5:23 17:15 39:7

full-time 8:11

fully 51:24

fun 47:8 48:1

fundraiser 60:25

funny 20:11 39:4 46:13 60:11

future 46:5,14

G

game' 34:21

gave 44:16 71:10

gene 15:7

generally 15:12

genes 15:5,7

give 6:5,12 13:10 14:23 21:4 52:1

63:5

gmail 12:9

Gofundme 77:18

good 26:4 33:5 60:1

Google 52:12 68:14 70:10 72:5

gossip 15:4

govern 21:13

governed 20:19 21:3

grabbed 11:7 12:3

Grammar 49:7 70:4 71:6 73:9,12 75:15,22 76:2,6,18,20,23 77:3,9, 13,22 78:16 79:3,4,23 80:2,18

Grammar's 66:20 76:24 77:18

78:2 79:25 80:20

Grammar/grammar 55:9

grant 21:6

granted 21:17 34:18

Great 5:17 6:23

grounds 65:23 75:3

guess 14:1 45:24

guided 12:5

guy 43:23

Н

half 32:25 59:11 61:4

hammer 40:4

hand 8:23 26:13 33:18 48:23 53:1 69:19 73:24

handing 40:1

happen 27:25

happened 51:15 52:10,11 60:23

happening 30:15,25

happy 33:9

heading 21:2

hear 32:9

heard 32:20 74:8

held 75:6

helpful 10:21 29:25

Hennessy 27:11

Hey 34:14

high 7:22

hire 58:9 72:15

hired 72:1

history 4:12,13 15:24 30:18 49:6,

8,10

honest 81:20

honestly 45:21 81:5

hoo 34:15

hope 5:6 45:3,23,25 46:8 47:12,

13

hoped 38:23

hour 10:4 81:18

house 60:24

hundred 28:23

husband 32:13

hyperlink 10:8,11

1

idea 15:2 45:21 47:10 49:13 61:3

identification 5:12 9:2,6 14:22 17:14 18:2,11,18 19:8 20:24 22:18 33:25 35:11 36:6,20 37:10, 23 39:25 41:14 43:16 48:13 49:3 55:7 57:15,24 58:4,13 64:25 67:9

69:2 71:12 75:12

identified 54:22 55:2 71:2 78:6,

16

.

identifies 22:1,8 23:11 58:23

65:4

identify 35:1,23 36:13 37:3 38:11

44:20 45:1 65:20 68:12,17

identifying 11:2 75:13

idol 43:25 44:11

image 17:18 19:2 22:23,24 27:10 37:24 40:7 41:4 49:16,17 52:12

53:4 55:12 68:14 70:10

imagery 17:7

images 35:16 38:7 39:3,19 40:7,

8,9 42:5

imgur 67:13 68:23

imgur.com 67:11

immediately 40:23 41:1,4

impact 43:4

impacted 66:20

important 6:5,19

impossible 14:19

incident 67:4

included 22:10 24:5,13 29:9

80:12

including 31:14 79:5

incomplete 49:9

independent 57:5

independently 80:19

indication 26:16 27:4

individual 30:24

individually 43:6

individuals 78:20 79:21

information 10:3 16:15,19,20,25 21:1 22:1 23:21,24 24:9,15,22,24

25:3,7,12,16,17 48:19 54:7,22

55:2 71:22 80:8 **informative** 8:5

infringed 73:11

infringement 43:6 44:6,8

initial 53:25 54:8,12,17,23

initiated 73:15,17

Ink 61:17 62:1,3,24 63:4,6

inquiries 69:7

Instagram 13:13

instance 15:25

instructions 5:23

insulting 12:1 31:13 76:15,25

77:22 79:8,12,18 80:1

intellectual 21:3

intend 59:7,14 62:2

intended 39:4 59:1

intent 45:3

internet 14:7 15:25 34:6,15 36:8

43:24 44:4 67:2

interrogatories 8:25 9:13,24

10:8 53:14 61:24,25 62:9,13 63:8,

21,24 65:3 68:16 71:8 76:9

interrogatory 10:9,20,23 53:22,

24 62:4,23 63:13 64:2,7 65:17,23

66:3,4 74:6,14,15 76:12 78:9,18,

21 80:4,6 81:9

interrupt 6:20 52:6

involved 11:25

IP 21:4,7,8,9 65:20

Ippoliti 40:14

issue 75:8

J

January 35:14 58:18

Jennifer 40:14

joke 17:19 29:9 51:4

jokes 15:5

Joseph 5:25 27:10

Josh 26:4 28:3 32:13,25 33:16

46:2

June 71:8,14 72:21 73:1,12

Junior 12:21

Κ

kind 6:18 12:25 14:13 28:12 29:11

knew 59:25 60;2

knowledge 12:15 13:6 15:4

25:10 33:22 35:8 36:17 38:9

www.NCDepo.com info@NCDepo.com

52:19 55:17 57:5

lack 43:4

language 21:16 76:1

large 10:8 50:12 79:15

latest 39:10

law 43:13 65:19 66:5 71:16 72:24

73:2

laws 42:25 43:9

Lawson 3:7 5:5 47:23 74:11

75:5.10

lawsuit 8:20

lawsuits 73:15 74:3

lawyer 24:7

learn 72:4

learned 40:14 43:9 61:17

left 63:15 75:15 79:1 80:1

legal 22:16 56:8,9,11 65:21 69:4

71:17,18,23 73:8

level 17:19

leveled 34:21

levels 17:3,20 18:4,6 35:19 37:1, 25 38:2,22 40:15 43:22 49:15

53:1 55:10 58:1

liable 43:6

Liburd 27:1

license 21:7,8,17 71:3

licensing 70:20

Liebowitz 65:19 66:5 72:4 74:9

life 15:5,25

lightning 46:4

likes 28:2

link 10:19 26:20 29:9 30:12 31:6.

14 48:3,4,6 49:21

linking 31:21 48:16

list 31:12 34:14

Listen 73:20

literally 32:4

litigation 65:20 66:8,9

live 10:13 26:20 29:21

lives 29:24

log 74:12

long 8:9 16:14,15 28:22 49:24

longer 26:19

looked 10:17 29:17 31:1 38:15

39:13 62:1 72:24

lower 26:12

lucky 46:5

Luke 34:5

М

Macklemore 30:9 31:9

made 10:24 27:24 34:14 38:22 39:9 42:19,22 45:13,16 51:10 58:8 60:4,17,24 61:8,11 63:15

66:13,23 68:9 75:19,20,22 78:13 80:19

majoring 7:6

make 6:8,21 14:16,17 17:3 18:24 19:4 22:4 25:21 30:10 46:8,20 47:10 59:7 60:16,17 65:7 66:11

68:15

makes 6:7 45:21

making 30:9 63:13,16 66:15

73:19 79:8

man 40:16

management 21:25 23:21

24:15,21,24 25:3,7,12,16 54:7

72:9

March 17:17

mark 22:19 29:23

marked 3:12 4:2 5:12 9:2,6 14:22 17:14 18:2,11,18 19:8 20:24

22:18 33:25 35:11 36:6,20 37:10, 23 39:25 40:1 41:14 43:16 48:13

49:3 55:7 57:15,24 58:4,13,14

64:25 67:9 69:2 71:12 75:12

master's 7:6,13

materially 64:15

materials 11:21 39:15

Matt 40:14

matter 8:20 10:13 12:11 43:21

Matthew 5:2,25 33:3 47:25 53:2 63:20 65:2

MB 26:25 27:8 29:7 32:24 39:7 40:1,10 47:20 49:5 52:22 74:10

mbradley@bradtech.com.

12:12

meaning 34:11

means 6:12 7:23 14:3 29:23

32:10,14 74:20

meant 32:20 40:23

mechanical 7:6

media 12:24 13:8 15:9,13,15

medium 62:3

mediums 33:20

meeting 43:25 44:10

member 12:21

meme 13:23,25 14:9,11,14,25

15:2,9,16,24 16:5,6,10,12 17:3 28:7,20 29:5 31:23 35:1 38:2,22,

25 41:20 42:23 43:17 45:4,10,20, 22 47:25 50:7

memes 14:16,17 15:4,8,13,15

17:6,8 19:2 37:25 38:12,23,24

memory 11:22,23 12:5 13:6

29:25

mention 76:18

mentioned 65:8

merchandise 28:11

Merriam-webster 14:23

message 69:23

messages 11:20 72:19

messaging 12:24

Messenger 13:1,2

met 43:22

metadata 22:7,10,15 23:3,5,6, 10,14 24:2,5,8,12 55:15

Mick 30:9 31:9

mile 60:24

mind 60:3

mine 78:3 80:1

minute 9:7 81:1

missing 49:17

mistaken 69:24

moment 64:23 65:8

money 41:2,7,8 74:23

month 30:19

months 47:8 72:20,23

morning 6:10

Motorola 7:25 8:2

Moulton 29:8

Moulton's 30:8

moved 62:13

Ν

names 79:25

nasty 31:15 75:16

necessarily 25:13 46:12

news 4:10 33:5 43:17

night 28:22

nod 6:7

non-exclusive 21:6

northern 60:23

notation 50:3

note 4:20 50:3

notice 3:14 5:10,13 27:18,21

65:24

notification 74:3

November 60:7 61:2,6 62:19 63:10

number 10:9,24 28:25 30:21,22, 23 35:18 44:19,24 45:6 46:18 53:22 62:4 65:17,23 66:3,4 78:9, 18,22 80:6

numerous 76:15

0

oath 6:10 53:11

Objection 49:11 56:9 75:2 78:23

objections 3:15,16 8:24 9:3

53:14 63:20 65:2,4

objects 65:22

obligated 6:12

occasionally 72:23

occurred 61:4

October 9:22

odd 30:20

Offer 34:7 36:8

OMG 33:3

online 44:22 45:3,18

open-ended 14:13,19

option 33:16

order 61:13

organizations 70:18

organized 11:6

original 15:16 19:23 22:24 24:17 29:20 30:3,4 33:14 48:4 50:7

64:18 79:14

overlaid 39:3

Ρ

P.M. 49:16 50:3

pages 19:12 39:2 68:3,13,17,20

71:1

parenthetical 29:12

part 23:5 32:22 59:5 80:10

part-time 12:20

particularity 78:10

parties 67:17 70:21,24 71:2 78:11 79:5 80:12

party 74:3

passing 50:5

pay 81:22

payer 65:20

paying 81:18

payment 81:25

PDF 22:21

PDFS 11:10,12

Penn 7:7 8:13

people 15:12 27:18,21 28:14,15 29:10 31:7 32:3,7,8,14,17 39:4,13 45:23,25 50:5,20 51:6 76:15 78:4,

6,15

perceived 79:18

percentage 74:25

perfectly 20:17

Perla 75:20

permission 16:8,13 21:5

person 14:10 15:3,19,22,23 16:6

18:20 28:17 34:20,24 44:2 76:5

person's 16:8

personal 39:2

personally 76:22

perspective 25:18 31:24,25

Phd 7:8,12

phone 7:25 8:3 19:24 22:8 50:6

photo 24:3 40:21 50:7 52:14

photograph 19:5,20,23 20:1,4,7 21:17,21 22:2,5,7 23:2,5,10,13, 15,17,20,24 24:2,13,14,16,19,22, 25 25:4,6,11,15,17 32:17 33:21 35:7,21 36:11,13,24 37:3,15,17 39:14 44:21 45:2 48:7 49:17 51:1, 2 53:5,25 54:8,12,18,20,24 55:3, 9,13,14,18 58:24 59:14 61:4,11, 14,21 62:2 67:2,5 69:25 70:9,12, 21.24 71:4 73:16 78:11

photographer 22:1,6,8 54:23 55:3

photographs 41:22,25 42:2

photos 21:3 40:4,16 43:5

phrase 48:2

physics 7:6

pick 62:15

picture 14:1 16:18,20,23 18:13, 19 21:22 29:9 34:6,14,20 37:15 45:13 50:4,6,9,17,18 52:18

pictures 16:24 17:4 20:11 38:13 41:24 42:18,22 43:23 44:3 46:15

place 15:18 52:13 79:9

places 29:5 70:1,5 73:11

plaintiff 44:21 45:2,5 54:3 63:20 65:2,22 66:5 76:13,14

Plaintiff's 53:24

Planet 55:9

play 17:6

pleased 31:24 34:9 45:24 47:13

pleasing 44:13

PLLC 65:19 66:5

point 6:24 14:9 30:14 31:17 45:11 51:20 52:16 59:16,17 60:13 69:24 78:19

points 14:17,18

Poke 3:18

pool 15:7

popular 41:6

portrayed 23:13

possession 45:6

post 3:19,20,21,25 4:5,8,9,11,14 10:12,24 11:23 13:22 16:21,22,25 18:3,5,13,15 20:7,10,11 21:8 22:11,19,21 23:2,3,17,19,20 24:5 25:7,24 26:13,19,21 27:16,19,22, 24 29:22,24 30:1,10 31:6,20 34:1, 4,14,20 36:21 39:7,10 40:2 41:15 42:19,22 46:15,18 47:21,25 48:3, 4,16 49:6,8 50:12 52:14 54:19 55:8 66:20 69:25 70:6 75:19

post's 49:25

posted 15:20,22 16:9 19:20 20:13 21:23 24:14 25:11 28:23 35:13 38:23 39:1,3 40:4,8 44:22 45:3,18,22 46:21 48:8,14

posting 15:17 16:6 24:25 25:15 29:5,20 30:3,4 33:14 46:12 47:16 76:25 77:3,9,22 79:14

postings 24:8

posts 11:11,15,20,24 12:1,2 20:16 28:1,3,4 80:20

potentially 12:17 13:3 79:18

Potter 43:20

pre-existing 17:12

prefer 56:19

present 69:11

preserve 24:8

Pretty 7:16

previous 39:10 41:24

primarily 12:5,19 15:9

primary 12:8

print 14:23 31:19 35:16

prior 8:16 17:6 18:7,14,21 19:1 30:10 38:7 60:8 61:6 67:17 74:3

privacy 20:13 21:5

privilege 65:24 66:12 74:12

privileged 57:2 71:22 75:6

problem 48:2

problems 52:17

procedure 59:5

proceeding 81:22,25

proceeds 66:8

produce 23:3 44:20 46:25 79:9

produced 22:15,20 23:1,15 24:6 42:10,16 49:5,7 64:15,19 65:9 68:25 74:12 75:13 79:5,11 80:13

production 8:2 9:4,16 11:1 44:15 46:18 49:9 68:16 78:7,20

prompted 17:2 50:17,24 51:3,17, 23 59:20

proof 23:22

property 21:3

protection 50:23

prove 24:4

provide 48:3 49:21

provided 24:7

public 4:16 10:15,18,24 16:11,12 20:13,15 26:19 47:16 49:8 57:25 60:4,5,19

publication 53:25 54:8,12,17,24,

published 29:1 37:12

pull 38:16 44:15

pun 34:21 35:18 41:17 51:4

puns 34:6,15 35:12,16 36:8

purchase 60:20

purpose 45:4

pursuant 5:17

pursue 73:8,9

put 10:11 24:24 30:12 41:3 52:14

Q

quarter 60:24

question 6:25 7:1 14:13,19 18:23 22:4 25:20 26:10 30:8 40:24 42:14 43:10 49:13 51:5,24 55:23 56:16,19,20,22,24,25 72:22 73:18,20,21 81:10

questions 6:5,6,13,16,19

quickly 52:6

quote 34:22

R

reach 70:17,20,23 71:2

reaction 39:2

read 20:21 23:6 27:15 31:7 43:12

realize 28:20

reason 14:8 47:3 61:24

reasons 26:20 35:17

recall 27:7 38:5 59:1 63:13 64:1 67:4,6,16,18,19,23 68:5,7 69:20, 22 71:5 77:25

receive 68:3 69:6

received 51:20 63:9 69:3 71:24 72:1 76:14

receiving 11:25 68:15

recently 15:21 60:21

recess 53:9 64:22 81:2

recollection 48:16

record 5:20,24 6:7,21

recording 6:4

recreate 75:16

Reddit 52:14 67:11,13 68:23

69:4,21

refer 19:5 20:4

referenced 77:11,12

referred 54:3 69:14

referring 20:5 62:5 70:6 79:12

registration 4:17,18 51:21 56:2

58:1,5,14,17 59:2,8

registrations 56:4

related 78:11

relation 76:14

relatives 77:2

relevant 63:6 78:8

remark 75:16

remarkable 11:14

remarks 76:15,18,25 77:10 79:1,

10 80:2

remedies 73:8

remember 7:25 9:21 11:12 12:2, 6 17:22 18:6,14,21 26:21,24 27:5,

13 33:18 36:2 37:6,20 60:13 63:16 64:6 68:9,17 69:18,19 71:9

76:2 81:5,6,8

remembering 71:13

remove 16:18,20 67:2,5 69:23

removed 55:13,15,17

removing 25:16

repeat 22:3

replies 31:12,19,20 40:18

reply 33:17

Report 37:12

reporter 6:4 18:24

reposted 16:6

reposting 16:13

represent 10:17

represented 74:8

request 5:19 6:25 9:4,15 11:1 23:2 44:15,19 45:6 46:18 62:23

68:16

requesting 48:6

requests 11:3

require 16:13 25:16,19

required 16:11 65:24

research 72:16

researching 72:21

reshare 16:24,25

reshares 30:25

resharing 16:22

respond 26:7 33:3 44:2 46:4

63:7

responded 29:8 43:22 69:21

71:10

response 6:6 23:1 31:11,22 45:4 53:23 54:4 62:4 63:3 66:4 69:3,4,

21 71:7 76:12 78:18 80:6,8

responses 3:16 9:3,12,15 10:7, 20 44:16 63:14,24 64:2,7,12,14

66:3 69:6 74:6.14

responsive 11:3,16,17,20 12:17

13:3,5 42:23 45:6 46:18

rest 20:3 31:20 32:21

restriction 6:24

retain 16:15

retained 66:5

reunion 59:25

revisit 51:15

RFP 45:5

Ricco 47:24

rights 21:3 72:9

Rosa 12:21

royalty-free 21:7

run 81:21

S

sale 60:4,5,18

Santa 12:21

Sat 9:25

school 8:15

search 12:16 13:2 52:12 68:14

70:10 72:5,6

searched 17:9

searching 11:16,19

section 20:25

select 58:21

sell 60:17 61:13 62:2 66:21,23

sense 6:8,21

separate 70:13

September 11:25 37:12

series 40:7

services 3:23 20:19,21 65:21

set 8:24 9:4 53:14 61:17 62:9,11

63:6,21 64:6,10,15,18 65:3 74:23

sets 63:24 64:1

setting 20:13 23:14

settings 21:5

settled 74:23

share 15:12,18,19 16:19 17:5

20:16 28:15,18 32:14,15,16,20 34:8 39:5,17 40:11 45:23 47:9,15,

19 52:9 75:20

shared 15:9,15 16:10 21:10 30:5,

6 35:3 39:14,21 42:23 45:25 47:12,13 50:4 55:18 70:1,2,4,5,7

shares 28:23 29:11 30:14,15,18, 21,22,23,25 31:2 32:2 33:11

59:21

sharing 21:1 27:21 32:4,6,8,10

33:21

Shirk 37:12

shirts 59:7,24,25 60:4,12,16,19, 25 61:3,9,11,13,18 62:3 66:19,21,

24

shortly 29:19 51:14 72:17

show 23:2,10 44:20 45:1 75:7 79:7

showing 70:12

BRADLEY vs ANALYTICAL GRAMMAR BRADLEY, MATTHEW on 12/12/2019 **shown** 21:22 24:3 34:9 sticky 26:1 **shows** 17:16 49:9,15,19 55:9 stopped 7:15 60:24 79:11 straightforward 81:13 side 43:21 strange 12:1 Sifter 4:6 37:11 stuff 12:23 sign 64:7 stunned 33:4,9 49:20 signature 53:17 **style** 15:3 **signed** 64:13 sub-licensable 21:6 significant 16:12 subheading 21:2 similar 17:6,8 46:24 Similarly 24:21 submission 68:2 single 64:14 70:17 situation 51:14 subsequent 30:18 **sleazy** 31:14 substance 52:7 57:2,4 smoothly 5:7 substituted 50:9 Snapchat 13:18 successful 15:8 social 12:24 13:8 15:9.13.15 sudden 14:7 28:24 sold 60:19 61:9 **sue** 71:6 specifically 21:4 22:9 spend 72:20 suggested 51:6 73:10 spending 41:8 Sunday 63:10,12 **split** 75:1 81:7 superceding 3:16 **spoke** 57:1 superimposed 52:25 spreads 15:3

stamp 71:10 start 25:24 51:24 Startac 7:25 started 11:25 27:16 31:15,23 33:9 52:20 starting 36:8

state 5:23 7:7 8:13 76:13 stated 58:8 70:9 76:8 statement 33:8 46:10 steal 26:5 27:11 32:10,14,15,16,

stealing 27:1 32:4,5,8

steps 61:13,16 sticker 24:25

subject 8:20 10:13 12:11 21:5 submitted 19:6 63:23 64:3,9 sufficient 44:20 45:1 63:4

superseding 3:15 8:24 53:13 63:20 65:4 66:3 74:5 supplement 10:20 supplemental 5:18 support 69:4

supporter 75:15,23,24,25 suppose 14:10

surgery 51:14 surprised 28:4,19 surprising 29:11 survival 15:6 sworn 5:3

Т

tabs 26:1 tag 54:11 takes 40:22 taking 64:23 talk 13:22 52:8 61:25

talked 56:23

talking 13:16 16:22 38:13 57:3 tech 4:5 7:22 36:22

technical 25:18 telling 44:3 78:12

tells 23:15 ten 14:16,17,18 28:2,14 73:25

terms 3:23 20:19,21 21:13

testified 59:13 testifies 5:4 text 52:25 53:5,7

thing 5:9,21 48:25 60:2 81:24 things 8:3 10:2 17:4 31:15 46:12 60:10 72:11,23

third-party 62:3 thirds 27:1 39:9 Thompson 34:5

thought 29:10 33:5 41:5 50:20 59:9,17 60:1,11 75:17

thread 31:8 throw 12:8

Thursday 63:17 64:8

Tik 13:15

time 16:10 28:8.13 31:5 42:24 43:24 44:4 51:11 55:24 59:17 61:8 67:20 68:10 71:10,24 74:9, 13

timeline 30:8 times 12:20 70:1,3,4 title 58:20,21

titled 63:19 65:1

today 5:14 6:16 17:24 24:4 29:17 37:6,20

Tok 13:15

told 5:13 56:11

Tonya 27:1

top 17:19 44:19,24 46:3

topic 74:7

total 67:21 69:6

track 15:24

traction 33:3

transferable 21:6

travel 5:7

true 32:21 34:3 62:23 74:13

78:22,24,25

truthful 6:13

truthfully 6:16

Tumbler 13:20

turn 10:7 27:8 29:7 30:7 32:24

43:20 44:18 53:13,16,19

twenty 7:17

twisted 4:6 37:11

twitter 3:19,21 13:11 18:4,20

Tyler 43:20

type 70:23

typed 9:25

types 47:6

typically 28:2 32:7 75:5,8

U

uh-huh 8:1 10:10 17:21 19:19 27:3 35:15,20 37:16 38:1,4,14 40:17 41:21 42:17 50:8,14 52:24

53:21 64:4

ultimate 30:25

un-huh 6:7

unaware 24:9 29:5

undergraduate 7:5

understand 6:10,12 7:2 9:17 21:16 22:4 29:16 42:14,24 43:2 53:10 63:23,25 72:22 74:16

understanding 43:4 56:12

understood 20:5 25:21 66:15 74:11

unexpanded 31:12

unexpectedly 50:5

unilad 4:5 36:22

units 15:4

University 7:7 8:13

unknown 35:17

unmeme'ed 48:17

uploaded 61:21

URL 17:15

usage 15:3

٧

VA 58:15

Vallee 26:4 32:25 46:2

Vallee's 26:13

verbal 6:5

verification 62:16 63:2 64:8,13

verified 62:22

verify 29:22 50:11 63:1

Verna 31:15

version 29:21 36:11 48:1,8,17

videos 21:4

view 31:11 33:16

viral 14:4 28:9,21 31:23 33:9 38:23.25 39:21 41:10 46:9.21

47:10

visible 24:3

W

wait 40:24 41:6

waiting 40:23

walk 17:11

Walker 65:19

walking 25:24

wanted 31:7 39:19 72:14

warned 44:5,7

watermark 24:22 40:15 41:3

42:8 48:22,24,25

Wayne 47:24

web 10:11 68:2,3,13,17,20 71:1

78:2 79:2

websites 68:6 70:13

week 29:20 30:1,4,8 33:13 47:7

51:13,15 52:10

weeks 30:3,16

widely 30:5

widespread 32:2

woo 34:15

word 11:13 16:14 18:5 63:15,18

64:17,19 68:18,20

words 14:2 17:7 39:3 50:19,20,

21 51:6,12 76:2

work 7:9 8:16,17 12:22 43:23

44:2,21 45:2,14,16 50:6 51:14

58:8,20 59:6

worker 8:7

working 7:7,15

works 46:8,24 47:6

workwise 52:11

worldwide 21:7

worry 81:14,15,19,20,23

wow 49:20

written 18:5

wrong 17:3,19 18:5,6 35:18

36:10 37:1 38:2,22 43:21 49:15

53:1 55:10 56:7 58:1 80:23

Υ

year 7:17 29:13,17,18,23 51:8

59:11 61:4

years 7:17 13:17 29:19 47:4

60:10,15